# Editorial Team

## Co-Editors in Chief

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Institution</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Laura Di Ferrante</td>
<td>Università degli studi di Milano, Italia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Katie A. Bernstein</td>
<td>Arizona State University, USA</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Associate Editor

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Institution</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mónica Aznárez Mauleón</td>
<td>Universidad Pública de Navarra, Spain</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Board

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Institution</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Laura Alba-Juez</td>
<td>UNED, España</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Janice Aski</td>
<td>The Ohio State University, USA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Salvatore Attardo</td>
<td>Texas A&amp;M University-Commerce, USA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sonia Lucia Bailini</td>
<td>Università Cattolica di Milano, Italia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paolo Balboni</td>
<td>Università Ca' Foscari, Italia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nancy Bell</td>
<td>Washington State University, USA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Flavia Belpoliti</td>
<td>Texas A&amp;M University-Commerce, USA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hugo Bowles</td>
<td>University of Rome Tor Vergata, Italia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Margarita Borreguero Zuloaga</td>
<td>Universidad Complutense de Madrid, España</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Diana Boxer</td>
<td>University of Florida, USA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ruth Breeze</td>
<td>Universidad de Navarra, España</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nicolò Calpestrati</td>
<td>Università per Stranieri di Siena, Italia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rubén Chacón-Beltrán</td>
<td>UNED, España</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Viviana Cortés</td>
<td>Georgia State University, USA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emma Dafouz</td>
<td>Universidad Complutense de Madrid, España</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Roxanne Barbara Doerr</td>
<td>Università degli studi di Brescia, Italia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Giuliana Garzone</td>
<td>IULM, International University of Languages and Media, Italy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cinzia Giglioni</td>
<td>Sapienza, Università di Roma, Italia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elisa Gironzetti</td>
<td>University of Maryland, USA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Carlo Guastalla</td>
<td>Alma Edizioni, Italia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Javier Muñoz-Basols</td>
<td>University of Oxford, UK</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Amanda Murphy</td>
<td>Università Cattolica di Milano, Italia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elena Nuzzo</td>
<td>Università degli studi di Roma Tre, Italia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Diego Pascual y Cabo</td>
<td>University of Florida, USA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Susana Pastor Cesteros</td>
<td>Universidad de Alicante, España</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emilia Petrocelli</td>
<td>Università per Stranieri di Siena, Italia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lucy Pickering</td>
<td>Texas A&amp;M University-Commerce, USA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sergio Pizziconi</td>
<td>Università della Calabria, Italia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elisabetta Santoro</td>
<td>Universidade de São Paulo, Brazil</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Israel Sanz-Sánchez</td>
<td>West Chester University, USA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Laurel Stvan</td>
<td>University of Texas at Arlington, USA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paolo Torresan</td>
<td>Alma Edizioni, Italia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eduardo Urios-Aparisi</td>
<td>University of Connecticut, USA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ada Valentini</td>
<td>Università degli studi di Bergamo, Italia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Massimo Vedovelli</td>
<td>Università per Stranieri di Siena, Italia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Veronica Vegna</td>
<td>The University of Chicago, USA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Miriam Voghera</td>
<td>Università degli Studi di Salerno, Italia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manuela Wagner</td>
<td>University of Connecticut, USA</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Coordinators of the Editorial Staff

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Institution and Location</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Angélica Amezcuá</td>
<td>University of Washington, USA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cinzia Giglioni</td>
<td>Sapienza Università di Roma, Italia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Roxanne Barbara Doerr</td>
<td>Università degli Studi di Brescia, Italia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emilia Petrocelli</td>
<td>Università per Stranieri di Siena, Italia</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

# Translators & Proofreaders

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Institution and Location</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mª Paz Azparren Legarde</td>
<td>Universidad Pública de Navarra, España</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kathryn Baech</td>
<td>Independent translator and teacher, USA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ombretta Bassani</td>
<td>Università degli Studi di Pavia, Italia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Silvia Bernabei</td>
<td>Hockerill Anglo European College, UK</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alessandra Callà</td>
<td>Independent translator and teacher, Italia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Francesca Cappellini</td>
<td>Università di Milano, Italia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vinicio Corrias</td>
<td>Universidade de São Paulo, Brazil</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Virginia Di Carlo</td>
<td>Università per Stranieri di Siena, Italia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cristina Gadaleta</td>
<td>Independent teacher and researcher, UK</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bridget Fomundam</td>
<td>Università per Stranieri di Siena, Italia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>David Giménez Folquéz</td>
<td>Universitat de València, Espanya</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Megan Hoare</td>
<td>National University of Ireland, Maynooth</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ilaria Lanè</td>
<td>Università per Stranieri di Siena, Italia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Giuseppe Maugeri</td>
<td>Università Ca’ Foscari di Venezia, Italia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Diletta Manasse</td>
<td>Università per Stranieri di Siena, Italia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Viviana Mirabile</td>
<td>Independent proofreader and teacher, Italia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maryam Moeini Meybodi</td>
<td>University of California, Berkeley, USA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sendy Monarrez Rhone</td>
<td>Texas A&amp;M University-Commerce, USA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marta Pilar Montañez Mesas</td>
<td>Universitat de València, Espanya</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Luca Morazzanno</td>
<td>Freelance proofreader and translator, Italia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Angela Mura</td>
<td>Universidad de Alicante, España</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lillie Vivian Padilla</td>
<td>Sam Houston State University, Huntsville, USA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ellen Patat</td>
<td>Università degli Studi di Milano, Italia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consuelo Valentina Riso</td>
<td>James Madison University, USA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Patricia H. Robison</td>
<td>Università per Stranieri di Siena, Italia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pau Sitjà Márquez</td>
<td>Università per Stranieri di Siena, Italia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>John A. Tkac</td>
<td>James Madison University, USA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>David Julian Walthall</td>
<td>Università per Stranieri di Siena, Italia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sae saem Yoon</td>
<td>Arizona State University, USA</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

# Social Media

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Role</th>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Institution</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Manager</td>
<td>Giulia Lattanzi</td>
<td>Sapienza, Università di Roma</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Specialist</td>
<td>Giada Stallone</td>
<td>Sapienza, Università di Roma</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Table of Contents

### Articles

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Authors</th>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Weaving game and task into content-language integration: Proposing a game-mediated dual learning model</td>
<td>Yuchan Gao</td>
<td>1-20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A call for critical and open pedagogies in Spanish heritage language instruction: Students as knowledge producers of Open Educational Resources (OERs)</td>
<td>Inés Vaño García</td>
<td>21-38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oscillando tra sinofobia e sinofilia: un’analisi del discorso mediatico sui cinesi in Italia ai tempi del Covid</td>
<td>Andrea Scibetta</td>
<td>39-57</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Book Reviews

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Authors</th>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

All the articles in this issue underwent double blind peer review processes. We thank the anonymous reviewers who contributed to the quality of this issue.
Weaving game and task into content-language integration: 
Proposing a game-mediated dual learning model

YUCHAN (BLANCHE) GAO
Arizona State University

Received 26 January 2023; accepted after revisions 26 May 2023

ABSTRACT

Content-based instruction, task-based language teaching, and game-mediated learning are three pedagogical approaches that are perceived as effective in second and foreign language education. These approaches not only share common ground in a sociocultural and functional view of language learning but also share popularity as engaging classroom strategies in elementary, middle, and high school contexts. However, challenges may exist in ensuring content and language dual learning goals, designing language learning tasks, or implementing game-mediated activities. Therefore, this study seeks to describe the conceptual and methodological alignment among these approaches by reviewing recent research. Moreover, a game-mediated dual learning model is proposed to pinpoint a series of design components for language educators to consider when they integrate the aforementioned three approaches.

Key words: GAME-MEDIATED LEARNING, TASK-BASED LANGUAGE TEACHING, CONTENT-LANGUAGE INTEGRATION, DUAL LEARNING

La instrucción basada en el contenido, la enseñanza de idiomas basada en tareas y el aprendizaje basado en juegos son tres enfoques pedagógicos que se perciben como efectivos en la enseñanza de segundas lenguas y lenguas extranjeras. Estos enfoques no solo comparten una visión sociocultural y funcional del aprendizaje de idiomas, sino que también gozan de popularidad como estrategias atractivas en las aulas de primaria y secundaria. Sin embargo, pueden existir desafíos para garantizar objetivos de aprendizaje dual de contenido e idioma, diseñar tareas de aprendizaje de idiomas o implementar actividades mediadas por juegos. Por lo tanto, este estudio pretende describir la alineación conceptual y metodológica entre estos enfoques mediante la revisión de investigaciones recientes. Además, se propone un modelo de aprendizaje dual mediado por juegos para identificar una serie de componentes de diseño que los educadores de idiomas deben considerar cuando integran los tres enfoques susodichos.

Palabras claves: APRENDIZAJE BASADO EN JUEGOS, ENSEÑANZA DE IDIOMAS BASADA EN TAREAS, INTEGRACIÓN DE LENGUAS Y CONTENIDOS, APRENDIZAJE DUAL

L’istruzione basata sul contenuto, l’apprendimento linguistico basato su task e l’apprendimento mediato dal gioco sono tre approcci pedagogici considerati efficaci nell’insegnamento di lingue seconde e straniere. Questi approcci condividono la visione socioculturale e funzionale dell’apprendimento linguistico e risultano strategie di insegnamento coinvolgenti dalla scuola dell’infanzia alla scuola secondaria. Tuttavia, possono presentarsi delle sfide nel tentativo di garantire obiettivi di apprendimento duale di lingua e contenuto, nel progettare task di apprendimento linguistico o nell’implementare attività medicate dal gioco. Pertanto, questo studio cerca di descrivere l’alineamento concettuale e metodologico tra questi approcci esaminando ricerche recenti. Inoltre, viene proposto un modello di apprendimento duale mediato dal gioco per definire una serie di elementi progettuali che i/e docenti di lingua dovrebbero considerare quando integrano i tre approcci sopracitati.

Parole chiave: APPRENDIMENTO MEDIATO DAL GIOCO, DIDATTICA DELLE LINGUE BASATA SU TASK, INTEGRAZIONE DI LINGUA E CONTENUTO, APPRENDIMENTO DUALE

Yuchan (Blanche) Gao, Arizona State University
blanche.gao@asu.edu

© Gao 2023. This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License.
1. Introduction

In light of the call for more communicative language teaching practices, three approaches have emerged over the past four decades that are considered to be effective in second and foreign language teaching and learning (L2TL). These approaches consist of content-based instruction (CBI), task-based language teaching (TBLT), and game-mediated learning (GML). They are rooted in a sociocultural orientation of learning where emphasis is placed on providing opportunities for learning through activities that are student-centered, foster social interaction, and have real-world connections. Given the theoretical alignments and methodological commonalities among these approaches, several second language (L2) scholars have already explored their relationship. For instance, Ortega (2015) commented on the special issue that made the first attempt at exploring research interfaces between the fields of TBLT and CBI 1, and suggested that educators and researchers in both subfields share the vision of the inseparability of language and meaning. Moreover, the author pointed out that the fruitful integration of new digital and social technologies has raised possibilities for innovative practices that ensure engaging and effective content-language integrated practices.

Game-mediated learning (GML) approaches have gained increased attention as an emerging technology in the field of learning in general, and more specifically in L2 research. It is argued that, with careful design, games can promote deep and meaningful learning by immersing players in quests that prompt them to engage with active learning (Gee, 2003). Similarly, in L2 learning, game-mediated approaches not only increase learner motivation by allowing learner choices, but also provide a space for social interaction and real-world connection (Sykes & Reinhardt, 2012). Integrating these approaches can potentially create a multi-layered learning environment in which students are prompted to practice and learn both content and target language in a playful and efficient way by completing games and tasks. On the basis of this need, the present paper seeks to discuss some theoretical alignments and instances of methodological compatibility among CBI, TBLT, and GML. In the following sections, I will first provide an overview of the three approaches and their key assumptions and rationale. Next, I will explore the highlights of their compatibility of integration by reviewing the current theoretical and empirical literature. Lastly, a pedagogical model of how to use game-mediated and task-based activities to support content-language integrated learning is proposed, followed by a discussion of its implications and future implementations.

2. The three approaches

To better explain the relationship among the aforementioned three approaches, Figure 1 illustrates the overlapping connections and where the game-mediated dual learning model may be fitted. The following subsections provide a brief discussion of each approach and some of their key assumptions.

---

1 The author (Ortega, 2015) used the term Content and Language Integrated Learning (CLIL) in the original article. Various terms have been used in the literature to describe the integration of content and language, yet these names refer to similar content-language integrated practices (for a more in-depth discussion on this, see Cenoz, 2015). This study therefore uses “content-based instruction” (CBI) as an overarching term that encompasses different variations of content-language integrated practices.
2.1. Content-based instruction

Originated in Canadian immersion programs, CBI refers to the concurrent study of language and subject matter (Brinton et al., 1989). The practice of CBI is supported by several second language acquisition theories and empirical studies (Grabe & Stoller, 1997). In particular, this view of ‘form plus content’, as opposed to “form versus content”, is in line with the sociocultural orientation of L2 learning. From this perspective, learning takes place when learners use language to communicate, solve problems, and engage in other meaningful activities (Banegas, 2012; Grabe & Stoller, 1997). In content-based classrooms, students are exposed to a large amount of incidental language learning through the learning of content. This incidental language learning is contextualized and embedded within relevant discourse that is specific to the subject matter. Moreover, there is greater flexibility and adaptability for teachers to build activities that promote increased opportunities to learn the targeted language through learning content knowledge, and vice versa, into the curriculum. According to Stoller (2008), CBI has been used as an umbrella term that encompasses forms of CBI ranging from the extent of immersion (e.g., 90% using the second language, content-based themes in language classes) and educational levels (e.g., preschool, higher education). To better paint the picture of these variations, Met (1999) described a continuum of content and language integration with one end being language-driven (e.g., theme-based language classes), while the other is content-driven (e.g., immersion). Depending on the curricular contexts and student population, educators have the flexibility to choose and adapt different models along this continuum to better provide opportunities for both content and language learning. In addition, the integration of content and language has commonly been recognized as content-language integrated learning in Europe, and is considered a synonym for CBI (Coyle et al., 2010; Dalton-Puffer, 2007; Ruiz de Zarobe, 2008).

2.2. Task-based language teaching

Tasks have been investigated from a sociocultural perspective to promote learning by understanding how learners make sense and learn from the tasks they are asked to perform (Ellis, 2018; Ellis et al., 2019). The central claim of sociocultural L2 learning theory is that “participants always co-construct the activity they engage in, in accordance with their own socio-history and locally determined goals” (Ellis, 2018, p. 33). Unlike the psycholinguistic view of task, performance depends on the task-participant interaction, as opposed to the inherent properties of the task itself (Appel & Lantolf, 1994). The interaction between the learners, the teachers, and the setting is crucial for task-based researchers who adopt a sociocultural orientation, and thus focus on the process of accomplishing tasks and how such a process may contribute to language acquisition (Ellis, 2018). Moreover, sociocultural-oriented scholars believe that task participants could make sense of and make attempts to perform tasks that are beyond their current abilities by collaborating with other participants in order to scaffold each other’s attempts.

According to Ellis et al. (2019), tasks can be defined based on the following criteria: 1) a primary focus on meaning; 2) the presence of a gap; 3) learners’ reliance on their own linguistic and nonlinguistic resources, and 4) a clearly defined communicative outcome. On the other hand, non-tasks or less ‘task-like’ workplans, such as vocabulary cloze exercises, may also exist. With the advancement of technologies, tasks have been redefined in the context of technology-and-task integration. Based on prior task definitions, Gonzalez-Lloret and Ortega (2014) identified five definitional features of a technology-mediated task that is optimal for language learning, including:

1) a primary focus on meaning: a preplanned language goal that is embedded within the task should exist;
2) goal orientation: a clear communicative goal and outcomes resulting from the task should exist;
3) learner-centeredness: the task should be based on learners’ needs and wants, as well as allow learners to use their linguistic and non-linguistic resources to complete the task;
4) holism: the task should be authentic, relevant to learners, and directly related to real-world activities;
5) reflective learning: the task should involve cycles of reflection for learners to use their intellectual knowledge and personal growth.
As the authors suggested, technologies should be carefully chosen and planned into the tasks, rather than being used as translations or extensions of existing tasks or exercises. Moreover, different technologies (e.g., online websites, teleconferences, games) contain different affordances for L2 learning and teaching. As a result, the use of certain technologies should be justified by the degree of how they serve the overall educational purposes. To do this, we should follow the TBLT cycles that begin with needs analysis, task selection and sequencing, materials and instruction development, teaching, assessment, and evaluation (Norris, 2009).

### 2.3. Game-mediated language learning

By employing one of the most fast-growing emerging technologies, game-mediated learning has received expanding attention in the field of L2TL in recent years. Drawing on previous definitions, Sykes and Reinhardt (2012) pointed out several key components of a game, including voluntary play, binding rules, goal orientation, differing outcomes, and an internal rewarding system. They further emphasized that not all games contain all these features, so it is important to examine the gameplay experiences and players’ behaviors to further characterize the identification of an activity that is also a game. In line with the sociocultural view of L2 learning, a game can be viewed as a social practice, a new form of literacy, and “a productive model for game-informed pedagogy that can transform language learning experiences” (Sykes & Reinhardt, 2012, p. 3). In the context of L2TL, Reinhardt (2019) drew on the ecological concept of affordance and identified a list of affordances for game-mediated L2 learning. For instance, the multimodal nature of games supports contextualized language learning, and especially the use of narratives. Moreover, games allow for goal-oriented learning and feedback mechanisms. Additionally, games provide opportunities for language development through social interaction and collaboration.

A flourishing body of research on game-mediated L2TL has been developed in and out of classrooms. To conceptualize the uses of games, Reinhardt and Sykes (2014) proposed a framework for research and practice in digital games. This framework entails three broad methods for utilizing different kinds of games and differing ways of incorporating games into curriculum. For example, game-enhanced approaches refer to the use of commercial-off-the-shelf (COTS) games that are designed for entertainment purposes. Game-enhanced research seeks to investigate how games are used for learning in the wild or how they can be adopted in L2 classrooms. Game-based practices are defined as the adoption of educational games depending on how specific game design or game-based environments can afford L2TL. Lastly, game-informed perspectives draw from game and play principles and seek to understand how to use parts of concepts of game and play to transform learning experiences. Examples of this approach include gamified learning activities and language play.

### 3. Blending them all

As shown in the overlapping areas in the Venn diagram in Figure 1, prior research has explored the relationships between the aforementioned approaches (e.g., task-based content integration, game-mediated task design, and game-mediated content-integration). To develop an updated understanding of the recent literature, a selective review of empirical articles that were published from 2012 to 2023 was conducted. The databases used in this study included a combination of searches in several representative journals in the field of L2 learning and teaching (i.e., LLT, CALICO, System, ReCALL, CALL, TESOL Quarterly, TESOL Journal, Computer & Education) and a key word search in Google Scholar. The search terms contained four sets of combinations that aimed to cover all studies that focused on at least two of the three approaches:

1) “games AND content based learning OR content based instruction OR content language integrated learning OR content integrated approaches”;
2) “games AND task based language teaching OR task based language learning OR task based approaches”;
3) “games AND content integrated approaches AND task based approaches”;
4) “game”, “play”, “task”, “content.”

The inclusion and exclusion criteria that were followed in this review are listed below:

1) The search was limited to titles, abstracts, and keywords;
2) A focus on English as the targeted learning language was placed;
3) The included studies were conducted in L2 learning contexts (i.e., English as a Second Language (ESL) and English as a Foreign Language (EFL)), not when English was the students’ first language;
4) The included articles were limited to peer-reviewed and empirical studies (i.e., studies that reported empirical findings);
5) The included studies were carried out in formal classroom settings, as opposed to informal, extramural learning, or learning in the wild;
6) The method of intervention used in the included studies was game-mediated, as opposed to simulation or virtual worlds. Game-mediated practices include the use of entertainment, educational games, or game-/play-informed elements (e.g., gamified applications).

An overview of the included articles can be found in Table 3 in the appendix.

The analytical process involves two steps, beginning with an initial coding stage in which I reviewed and determined if the articles employed any combination of the three approaches. A total of 21 articles (n = 21) were divided into three categories according to the instructional approaches used, including i) game-mediated content integration (n = 9), ii) game-mediated task design (n = 9), and iii) game-mediated dual learning (n = 3). In the second stage, I conducted an in-depth reading of the included articles in terms of learning interventions (i.e., the game-mediated activities and tasks used in the studies), pedagogical mediation, learning outcomes, and a general description of the learning context and student population. In the next sections, I will discuss the key findings in relation to how these approaches might be used in combination with one another.

### 3.1. Task-based content integration

As indicated in the top left overlap in Figure 1, CBI and TBLT both appeared in the 1980s, in light of the call for more communicative language teaching methods (Bygate, 2016). These pedagogical approaches not only share roots in communicative teaching but also present commonalities that allow methodological connections to be made to maximize the potential of each approach (Lopes, 2020). By focusing on learning across disciplinary divides and through social interaction, CBI and TBLT depart from the traditional language teaching method where language is learned in isolation and relies on textbook activities (Lopes, 2020). Despite such similarities, there are four major differences in focus that lie between these two approaches, as illustrated in Table 1 (Ellis et al., 2019; Ortega, 2015). However, it is not hard to see that these differences exist at the level of focus rather than that of fundamental incompatibility. In fact, as Lopes (2020) has suggested, TBLT can be used to address some of the challenges posed by CBI. To help tackle the challenges faced by both CLIL and TBLT, researchers encouraged the combination of the two approaches. For example, Meyer (2010) suggested that the authentic communication and frequent negotiation of meaning that were fostered by language tasks enabled greater depth of content learning. Scott and Beadle (2014) also pointed out that TBLT could promote authentic communication and pushed language output through the use of the target language in interaction. Moreover, Lopes (2020, p. 8) argued that “... TBLT provides the scaffolding needed for CLIL classes to strike a balance between the cognitive and linguistic demands”.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>CBI</th>
<th>TBLT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Conceptualizing ‘meaning’</td>
<td>Content and subject matter learning</td>
<td>Experiential and goal-oriented learning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age groups</td>
<td>School age learners</td>
<td>College level students</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Educational focus</td>
<td>Foreign language teaching contexts</td>
<td>Outside the school contexts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Educational effectiveness</td>
<td>Balanced and mutually beneficial learning between language and content</td>
<td>Transfer of learning from classroom tasks to authentic tasks in the real-world</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Note. Adapted from Ellis et al., 2019, p. 18 and Ortega, 2015, p. 103.*
3.2. Game-mediated task design

Comparisons have been made between the design of a game and the design of a language learning task since they are similarly goal-oriented (Purushotma et al., 2009), as depicted in the bottom overlap in Figure 1. Meanwhile, games can be perceived as more authentic and meaningful tasks as they integrate aspects of narrative, play, and social interconnectedness (Purushotma et al., 2009). Sykes and Reinhardt (2012) also sustained that games are player-driven by nature, which means they embed different means for players to create and engage with authentic experiences. By adopting games or learning from game design, we make the learning task more learner-driven by endowing them with the agency or illusion of agency that learners drive their own learning. Prior studies have attested to the similarities between game design and task design and suggested that gameplay itself can be seen as a language learning task. For example, in a study investigating the effectiveness of a digital game-based task on the acquisition of word knowledge, Rasti-Beibahani and Shahbazi (2020) adopted a commercial adventure point-and-click PC game (Haunted Hotel: Death Sentence-Collectors’ Edition) and a walkthrough which is a guide to the game. The authors believed that adventure games are pedagogically suitable for this study because players engage with a series of tasks that require them to locate objects by searching the game interface, combining collected objects, or solving issues in previous tasks. The study recommended that a game-based task was more effective than a traditional vocabulary learning task, especially in terms of overcoming the complexity of vocabulary acquisition. With a focus on grammar learning, Kao (2020) and his collaborator (Reynolds & Kao, 2019) used an educational game (English Extras In Business with A, An, and The) to support the acquisition of the English article system. When designing the game used in the study, the authors foregrounded the feedback mechanic that provided both just-in-time and summative feedback. In particular, this game incorporated awareness raising and focused tasks (e.g., answering questions about specific English article uses) to ensure the practice and learning of the targeted linguistic form. Both studies reported positive effects on using the game in providing awareness-raising opportunities for the targeted linguistic form, stronger retention when combined with written corrective feedback (Reynolds & Kao, 2019), and more focused correction of article errors (Kao, 2020). Focusing on a tabletop role-playing game, McCollum (2023) identified a list of in-game tasks that are parallel to intermediate and advanced level speaking functions according to the ACTFL2 proficiency guidelines. The author claimed that the value of games for L2 learning included student motivation and potential increases in their interpersonal communication skills and linguistic proficiency (McCollum, 2023).

Additionally, game-mediated task design can be developed in combination with other technological affordances, such as place-based features and augmented reality (AR). Sydorenko et al. (2019) investigated a quest-type mobile AR game (ChronoOps) that was designed for language learning purposes. This game was narrative-driven and intentionally designed as a series of open-ended, under-specified tasks. As the authors suggested, when games are designed to fit the conceptualization of a technology-mediated task (Gozalez-Lloret & Ortega, 2014), they may provide useful environments for social interaction and language learning. In their study, students attended to the lexical items that were relevant to the AR tasks and physical locations. Moreover, strong goal-oriented collaboration was found between language learners and expert speakers. In short, these studies suggest that researchers tended to select or design games based on task criteria and guidelines that have been established in the task literature, and they reported the positive effectiveness of games that featured a task-based design.

In addition, having students design simple games from scratch has become a popular learning tool in fostering game-mediated task learning. In Butler’s (2018) study, she invited elementary students to design computer games with potential for L2 learning based on the key elements they were asked to identify from games (e.g., challenging, instant feedback) and vocabulary learning (e.g., repeating and reviewing, multiple modalities). The author argued that it is necessary to incorporate learning elements to make activities in games into meaningful tasks for learning that require students to reflect on useful game and learning elements, and that game design is a valuable learning task. One further study recognized the coherence between the use of tasks and other L2 pedagogical approaches in the context of using games as the pedagogical intervention, and sustained that the combination of TBLT and other strategies might result in more enhanced learning outcomes (Liu & Chu, 2010). The authors designed a context-aware ubiquitous-learning environment (HELLO) that embedded several learning games to help engage seventh graders in different learning activities. According to the authors, ubiquitous games blend real-world and virtual environments in which players can partially play

---

2 ACTFL stands for the American Council for the Teaching of Foreign Languages; more information on this can be found at https://www.actfl.org/.
games involving physical objects while playing a portion of the game involving virtual objects. The authors further explained that one of the games in this system (Campus Story game) was designed based on collaborative TBLT strategy in which players listened to sample stories and then collaboratively edited a story. Another study explored the combination of tasks and games in a flipped learning environment and suggested that secondary school students thus improved their communication skills and gained more confidence in speaking English (Muntrikaeo & Poonpon, 2022). The authors used a web-enhanced tool named Educaplay where teachers can create interactive learning activities for students. Several online game templates, such as matching, fill-in-the-blanks, and dialogue games, are available. These online language games are designed as activities with rules, goals, and fun elements, and used to provide a fun and more relaxing atmosphere for L2 learning (Muntrikaeo & Poonpon, 2022). In this study, tasks are described as meaning-focused activities that involve learners in understanding, manipulating, creating, or interacting in the target language to accomplish a communicative or no—linguistic result (Muntrikaeo & Poonpon, 2022). In particular, this study followed a pre-, during, and post-task design of the intervention. On the other hand, one study concluded that tasks are not always useful when compared to a self-directed approach (i.e., students do not need to follow the task sequence during gameplay) in the context of using an educational AR game-based system (Hsu, 2017).

3.3. Game-mediated content integration

As presented in the top right overlap in Figure 1, games have been utilized in supporting content learning and led to positive results in a variety of disciplines, such as mathematics, science, and social studies (Plass et al., 2020). In contrast, the use of games in facilitating content-language dual learning has rarely been discussed. Several studies have pointed out the effectiveness of serious games and how they facilitate both content and L2 learning. Serious games are typically designed for education and training purposes (Johnson et al., 2005) and are claimed to increase learning motivation and learning performance, and have the potential to facilitate subject content learning (Chen & Hsu, 2020). In Chen and Hsu’s study (2020), they sought to examine if university students acquire both content and vocabulary knowledge at the same time by using an interactive serious game (Playing History). They recorded learning gains in both vocabulary and history knowledge, and concluded that serious game can be both fun and educational. Focusing on teaching vocabulary for specific purposes (learning nursing content), Soyoof et al. (2022) had university students play a serious game (Saving Lives) and suggested increased knowledge in both healthcare content and English vocabulary. Meanwhile, although other studies did not define their games as serious games, they attempted to incorporate content learning as part of the learning goals involved in the design of the games. For instance, Baturay et al. (2022) designed a 2D-mobile single player tutorial game (ENglish) that aims to provide a practice opportunity for students (age 13) to develop English vocabulary, grammar, and reading skills while studying about environmental awareness. The learning of content (environmental awareness) is achieved when players answer questions about global environmental awareness to level up in the game. Moreover, Dourda et al. (2014) designed a plot-driven, web-based detective game (Whodunit) for students (age 11-12) to solve a number of problems that relate to the suspect’s whereabouts. Throughout the completion of this game, students were able to practice the targeted language as well as the geography-related content. Additionally, students’ reading skills, lexicon, motivation and collaboration were reported to be enhanced.

4. Bringing it all together: Proposing a game-mediated dual learning model

One goal of the present paper is to propose an instructional model that integrates three existing and interconnected pedagogical approaches to provide more and diverse opportunities for L2 practices. This intersection has not been systematically investigated at the time of writing this paper. The present study thus introduces a game-mediated dual learning model that utilizes the playful nature of games, applies the compatibility between game design and task design, and aims to provide more opportunities to deliver content-language integrated dual learning experiences. In this section, I will start by highlighting a few key principles from the literature on content-language integration, task, and game. I will then discuss the implementation of this model by proposing a pedagogical template. Selected examples from a classroom study will also be discussed to provide more empirical insight.

4.1. A content-language integrated view

The proposed model begins with a content-language integration component that entails the integrated view that L2 learning is enhanced in the context of subject content learning. This view moves away from the
traditional conviction that language is learned in isolation and reflects the sociocultural orientation of learning, as well as the functional view of language learning (Banegas, 2012; Grabe & Stoller, 1997). As stated in the seven strong rationales for CBI, Grabe and Stoller (1997) argued that CBI promotes incidental language learning, supports contextualized learning, offers increased opportunities for dual learning practices, and allows greater flexibility and adaptability to be built into the curriculum. This content-language integration can take place at all educational levels (e.g., elementary, secondary, higher education) and in all learning contexts (e.g., formal and informal, ESL and EFL, language and content classes). To better characterize the different possibilities of content-language integration, I adopt Met’s (1999) continuum that ranges from total immersion (approximately 90% of second language instruction) to the language-driven end (language classes with frequent use of content and theme-based courses). Depending on the target student population and the particular instructional context, intermediate variations of the models exist, such as sheltered courses and adjunct models (which purposefully connect language courses with subject-matter courses). Sheltered courses are commonly implemented at secondary and post-secondary levels, especially in second language learning contexts. A sheltered course “is taught in a second language by a content specialist to a group of learners who have been segregated or ‘sheltered’ from native speakers” (Brinton et al., 1989, p. 15). The goal of sheltered courses is to deliver the same amount of content instruction while making an evident accommodation of the instructional language, such as using simple grammar or repetition, based on the students’ level of language proficiency. Sheltered courses are therefore considered to be positioned at the content-driven end of the continua (Dueñas, 2004).

4.2. A task-based design

The second component in this model emphasizes the role of task-based design. Tasks are argued to be effective in L2 learning and teaching and have been both theoretically and empirically supported by prior literature (e.g., Ellis et al., 2019). Tasks have also been conceptualized on a continuum ranging from communicative activities that take form-focused approaches (Ellis, 2009) to everyday activities that reflect real-world interaction (Long, 1985; 2016) (Smith & González-Lloret, 2021). Within the literature on technology-mediated TBLT, González-Lloret and Ortega (2014) have recommended educators to follow the five, previously defined definitional features of a task. Among them, two features are of especially great importance in the stage of task design, i.e. being meaning-focused and goal-oriented. In determining whether a task is meaning-focused as opposed to form-focused, evidence of incidental language learning should be present even if there is a preplanned language learning goal (González-Lloret & Ortega, 2014). This means that learners participate in tasks that require them to naturally use the targeted language to solve problems. For example, in a content-driven class, students might be working on a learning task about physics but use English as the instruction and working language. When a task is meaning-focused, it is also likely to be goal-oriented, that is, to include some communicative purposes through the design of the task (González-Lloret & Ortega, 2014). The task plans offer a “language-and-action experience”, which means that the decisions that learners make during the task’s completion result in different outcomes (González-Lloret & Ortega, 2014, p. 6).

4.3. A game-mediated learning environment

The last component deals with the role of games in supporting task-based and content-integrated L2 learning. According to prior and current L2 research, we know that games have the potential to be used in various learning contexts with different student populations (Sykes & Reinhardt, 2012; Reinhardt & Sykes, 2014). Particularly in dual-learning environments, game-mediated activities that might promote dual learning contain either explicit and/or implicit opportunities for both content and language learning (e.g., Chen & Hsu, 2020; Dourda et al., 2014; Soyoof et al., 2022). Explicit opportunities for dual learning can be achieved by solving problems that are directly tied to the content area and/or language learning, such as using equations to solve physics problems or matching definitions to the target vocabulary. Implicit opportunities for dual learning refer to the use of content or language knowledge to solve problems, such as, using knowledge of speed and momentum to build bridges in a video game. Although students might not explicitly produce the targeted vocabulary or grammatical structures in their speech, they demonstrate an understanding of the meaning and/or usage of the linguistic form in the completion of tasks. Moreover, it is important to examine what players do when they participate in game-mediated activities and identify their affordances for both content and L2 learning. This shares similarities with task design in L2TL, in that learners engage in tasks that either target form-focused language practice or tasks that encourage learners to use the targeted language to solve problems.
4.4. Challenges in content-language integration

One challenge that exists in content-driven CBI models (e.g., sheltered courses) is the lack of knowledge and strategies necessary for teachers and L2 material designers to design and scaffold opportunities for L2 learning (Dueñas, 2004; Lopes, 2020). This lack of opportunities for language learning is not limited to sheltered courses but involves all content-driven CBI models. In fact, both content and language learning should be carefully planned because an overemphasis on content learning might hinder the accuracy and development of L2, which later affects content learning (Pica, 2002). To do so, educators could consider using game-mediated activities that help deliver learning experiences in a more playful and engaging format. Game-mediated activities refer to a careful selection of existing entertainment or educational games, or the design of wraparound activities (Sykes & Reinhardt, 2012) that are tailored to the learning targets. Examples of wraparound activities include redesigning the learning activities so as to make them about the game content and/or gameplay (e.g., write a brief reflection journal about the gameplay process and identify what physics knowledge was used) or integrating some of the game elements into the learning activities (e.g., a list of spy-themed and puzzle-based tasks designed to target both physics and English practices). Note that the incorporation of game elements here is somewhat different from gamification, which is the adding of game elements, typically incentive systems, to the existing learning activity without necessarily redesigning the activity itself (Plass et al., 2020).

4.5. Challenges in task-based design

Meanwhile, another challenge that is faced by task designers, especially those having the goals of providing ample opportunities for content-language dual learning, consists in designing tasks that are both engaging and effective (Ellis et al., 2019). Specifically, task-based instruction might not be useful when implemented alone due to a lack of opportunities to engage in tasks during instruction time, fear, shyness, or even the refusal to use the target language when performing tasks (Carless, 2002; Littlewood, 2007; McDonough & Chaikitmongkol, 2007). To help with this, educators could turn to game-mediated activities. Gameplay itself can be a language learning task. A parallel between game design and task design has long been argued by L2 scholars (Sykes & Reinhardt, 2012). Games, and especially games that are designed for entertainment purposes as opposed to educational purposes, are typically designed to prioritize content rather than form. Players interact with the game by reading or listening to the in-game dialogue or instruction, which is set in the targeted language, and making decisions on how to proceed in the game. Games may also be used as part of learning tasks that aim to deliver interactive and collaborative task experiences. In co-play scenarios (e.g., co-op, multiplayer), players interact with one another through communication, collaboration, or competition, and thus make decisions on how to play the game. Additionally, players might search for resources in the larger game community by participating in fandoms, tutorials, streamings, or other social activities. In short, games are meaning-focused, outcome-based, social activities that provide player-learners with varied opportunities for social interaction and collaboration. By participating in these problem-solving interactions, players are assumed to use some level of the targeted language if the language is part of the instruction. Apart from using games as a whole, certain elements or techniques in game design may be borrowed to enhance the design of language learning tasks. One example that has already been commonly adopted is gamification. Gamification refers to simply adding the incentive system to the learning activities without necessarily redesigning the activity (Plass et al., 2020). However, gamified products have been critically defined as “chocolate covered broccoli” (Klopfer, 2008) that might be extrinsically motivating at first but will not last long once the learners figure out that it is just another sugar-coated exercise. On the other hand, game-based learning refers to the redesigning of learning activities that either fully or partially utilize game elements. For example, game-based task design might incorporate the role of narratives and set up a fictional world in which learners take on imaginary roles and persona.

To summarize, there are three key components in this game-mediated dual learning model, namely content-language integration, task-based design, and game-mediated activities. The first component calls for an integrated view of L2 learning through the simultaneous learning of subject content. Although this model has potential for both content-driven and language-driven paradigms, the current iteration of the model emphasizes content-driven classrooms. Hence, the goal of this model is to provide opportunities for both content and language learning. The second component focuses on task-based design, as tasks have traditionally been adopted as a way to design learning activities that are goal-oriented and meaning-focused, which has shown its effectiveness in promoting dual learning. However, tasks that are created by task designers are not always perceived or implemented as engaging activities. One possible reason for this is that the tasks are
instruction-driven as compared to learner-driven; in other words, learners do not have enough agency or choice while they engage with task completion (Sykes & Reinhardt, 2012). One way to help design learner-driven tasks is to use or learn from game design in developing L2 tasks. Games are structured on the notion of providing agency, or the illusion of agency, to players. This player-driven design allows opportunities to include learners in defining their own goals of learning or carrying out the learning activities (Sykes & Reinhardt, 2012). For instance, we can give learners a selection of tasks from which to choose or offer differing paths to complete the task and reach targeted learning goals. This learner-driven design helps create tasks that are relevant to the learning goals, but also give in-depth consideration to the varied learning experiences that students might have with the tasks. As for the selection and implementation of games or game elements, Reinhardt and Sykes’ (2014) framework has provided a useful guide to understand the broad uses of L2 tasks that can be designed or modified based on games that are COTS or educational, as well as wraparound activities that can be used to ensure more explicit and implicit dual learning with, through, and about games.

5. Practical implications: Introducing a game-mediated dual learning design framework

Another goal of the present study is to provide a design framework for researchers and educators using game-mediated activities in redesigning a task-based and content-integrated L2 learning environment. As shown in Table 2 below, this design framework aligns with the previously proposed game-mediated dual learning model in which three key components are described along with specific guiding questions. In the first component (i.e., content-language integration), practitioners identify their pedagogical within the content-language continuum (Met, 1998), then they individually identify opportunities for both content and language learning. I borrowed some guiding elements from Lopes’ (2020) template used to design tasks for content and language-integrated learning. The second component is the incorporation of a task-based design. This component directs practitioners to think deeply about specific ways to ensure opportunities for dual learning delivery and have the potential to be authenticated by learners. To do this, practitioners first reflect on how meaning is emphasized in the tasks. In other words, they consider what kinds of explicit and/or implicit learning opportunities are present when students complete the tasks. Then, they examine the communicative goals of the tasks by focusing on which tasks promote communication and what kind of communication (e.g., collaboration, negotiation) is embedded in said tasks. Lastly, practitioners consider how these tasks can allow learners to choose and drive their own learning. The third component is the use of game-mediated activities. This component provides guidelines for practitioners to inspect game-mediated activities in terms of their affordances for content-language dual learning and task-based design. When considering the types of tasks, I adopted Prabhu’s (1987) typology of task types, which include information gap, reasoning gap, and opinion gap tasks. This typology is considered the most useful source and based on how the information in a task is handled by the participants (Ellis et al., 2019).

As an addition to the explanations of each design framework component, Table 2 contains authentic examples from an empirical study that was conducted in a U.S. high school in 2022. Accordingly, I explored the use of game-mediated activities in a sheltered physics class for English language learners in a high school in the U.S. in the present study. The intervention consisted of two parts: 1) playing a video game named *Bridge Construction Portal* that is commented to practice basic physics knowledge, and 2) completing researcher-designed wraparound activities that were designed for dual-learning targets in the participating class. The video game that was used in this project was rated “very positive” in the Steam community and recommended as an online game to practice simple physics knowledge. In this game, players are new employees at a science test lab, and their job is to build bridges, ramps, slides, and other constructions based on the given materials and scenarios in the test chamber. If the construction is successful, the designed bridges safely transport the test vehicles from the entrance to the exit door; however, if it fails, the vehicles will fall into deadly acid pools. This game was selected due to its relevance in providing opportunities for utilizing simple physics concepts as well as its popularity among public players. Moreover, this is an online laptop-based game, which made it easier to implement in a classroom setting. Although this game was designed for single players, participants in this study were instructed to co-play by making design decisions and task completion decisions together.
### Table 2
The design framework of a game-mediated dual learning model

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Design components</th>
<th>Guiding questions and examples</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>1. Content-Language Integration</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| 1.1 Identify the dual learning model | **How is content-language integration reflected in the study?**  
This is a sheltered ELL physics course in which all students are ELLs, and the instructor is a content expert who has minimum training in working with linguistically diverse students.  |
| 1.2 Identify opportunities for content learning | **What are the content learning targets?**  
➔ **Content area:**  
High school physics  
➔ **Topic(s) or question(s) addressed (knowledge):**  
Speed and momentum  
➔ **Content skills to be developed:**  
Understand the concepts of speed and momentum (e.g., Newton’s Laws)  
Use physics equations to solve problems about speed and momentum  
➔ **Materials:**  
A textbook titled “Physics A First Course” selected by the teacher  
A free online website titled “the Physics Classroom”  
➔ **Processing information from the provided materials:**  
Use Newton’s third law to explain various situations  
Explain the relationship between Newton’s third law and momentum conservation  |
| 1.3 Identify opportunities for language learning | **What are the language learning targets?**  
➔ **Specific linguistic knowledge**  
Vocabulary:  
Newton’s third law, momentum, impulse, law of conservation of momentum  
➔ **Language learning skills**  
Be able to verbally explain the problem-solving process when working on physics problems  |
| **2. Task-Based Design** |  |
| 2.1 Focus on meaning | **How is language learning explicitly or implicitly designed in the task(s)?**  
Students explicitly use the targeted vocabulary and grammar during the language-oriented wraparound activities.  
Students implicitly use everyday English and/or science-specific English to work on tasks together during the gameplay and physics-oriented wraparound activities.  |
| 2.2 Orient learning goals | **What are the communicative goals reflected in the task(s)?**  
During gameplay, students communicate with each other in deciding how to build bridges to successfully transport the testing vehicle. They may or may not use the physics vocabulary, but they will have to use physics concepts to complete the in-game quests.  
During the wraparound activities, students collaborate on completing the tasks. They might discuss the task completion and/or how to distribute the roles when working together.  
The gameplay is set up to be co-play in groups of three students. Apart from interacting with the game, players need to communicate with one another to collectively make decisions. Players will remain in the same group to complete the wraparound activities.  |
2.3 Design learner-driven experiences

To what degree do learners have choices to design and/or complete the task(s)?
Students’ learning experiences are guided by a brief story design that asks them to find the mole in their class. To do this, students will play the video game as they apply their language and physics knowledge, as well as communication and collaboration skills. In addition, students are given wraparound activities that are designed to purposefully practice their language or physics knowledge and skills.

Instructional feedback is provided through the in-game feedback (e.g., a quick pop-up window explaining what the object is or what the next step should be), the wraparound activity hint system (e.g., special spy note providing detailed information regarding students’ answers), and instructor’s real-time feedback.

3. Game-Mediated Activities

3.1 Represent dual learning goals

3.1.1 How is dual learning represented in the game-mediated activities?
Content and language learning are explicitly planned in the completion of wraparound activities. These activities are designed to be either physics-oriented or language-oriented. Dual learning is also implicitly embedded in the play of the game. Players need to use their knowledge of the English language and physics to make decisions on how to build bridges to safely transport the testing vehicles.

3.2 Follow a task-based design

What kinds of tasks are embedded in game-mediated activities (e.g., information gap, reasoning gap, or opinion gap)?
Since the game is puzzle-based, players need to analyze the given situations and make in-game decisions. When playing as a group, students make use of the information that each of them gathers while providing reasons for certain moves, and exchange options to reach conclusions. The wraparound activity implements a spy-themed narrative design and a hint system that requires players to solve puzzles that lead to the final secret message. For example, players will receive numbers, letters, words, or hints based on the answers they provide for the physics or language problems. These puzzles will eventually lead players to solve the question as to which of the players is a mole in this mission. By working on the physics or language-related tasks, as well as the game puzzles, students apply skills such as dissecting information, providing reasoning, and exchanging opinions.

Note. ELL stands for English language learners.

Once the participants finished each level of the game, they were given one physics-related wraparound activity (Figure 2) and one language-related activity (Figure 3). Additional instructional support to game-mediated learning has been considered beneficial (Dixon et al., 2022; Wouters & Oostendorp, 2013), especially when using a COTS game that is not specifically designed for language learning (Sykes & Reinhardt, 2012). This study incorporated an alternating design of the learning tasks, namely, gameplay → wraparound activity → gameplay. In this manner, the target content and language skills were built into the larger gaming experience by participating in the learning activities that were designed based on the gameplay content. This alternating design is different from isolating gameplay from the supplementary instructional materials that had typically been used in previous relevant research studies. The goal of the intertwined task completion of gameplay and wraparound activities aimed at generating diverse opportunities for participants to think about science, talk about science, and do science in a fun and reflective manner. The design of the physics-related activities was based on the instructional materials used by the instructor. The language-related activities were designed to practice the targeted vocabulary, grammatical structures, as well as simple reading and writing skills, especially in the discourse of high school science. These learning targets were identified based on the instructional
materials (the knowledge and skills the instructor sustained learners already had or should have) and the game (what language or game-specific content might confuse during the gameplay).

Figure 2. Example of a wraparound activity that targets physics learning
This project concluded with a final mission in which participants pieced together all the hints that they received after completing each wraparound activity. This hint system design was inspired by the reward system that is typically embedded in puzzle games. It motivates players internally by prompting them to discover the puzzle pieces and the hidden messages, as compared to simply adding the incentive system to the tasks. The design behind the final task also followed a problem-solving structure that had previously been introduced to the students. This structure is commonly used and taught in science education and is reinforced in this project (see Figure 4).
6. Conclusions

The present study seeks to highlight the compatibility between three existing pedagogical approaches (i.e., CBI, TBLT, and GML) in L2 education by reviewing current theoretical articles and empirical studies. In particular, this paper identifies the complementary overlaps among these approaches and introduces a potentially stronger instructional model integrating the three approaches. In addition, an instructional model of game-mediated dual learning is proposed. This model is intended not to be prescriptive or exhaustive, but rather serves as a starting point for an ongoing investigation into how to best design, evaluate, and implement game-mediated activities that are task-based in supporting content-language dual learning. For L2 researchers, this study answers the call for more investigation of the common ground and differences among L2 perspectives and approaches (Ortega, 2015) and explores the interface among three existing L2 pedagogies that hold mutual benefit to both research and educational communities. Moreover, L2 educators can benefit from using the template as a framework in guiding their understanding of how to implement game-mediated activities in their classrooms. Lastly, game designers, especially those who seek to bridge the gap between learning and game design, may also benefit from this study in learning the potential ways to implement game mechanics and the design of wraparound activities to create more and diverse opportunities for learning.

Games exist in various types and genres, and provide different affordances for L2TL. As we begin to explore this new and existing field of gamemediate dual learning, it is important to remember that there is no single way of utilizing games, designing tasks, or creating dual learning experiences. Just as a group of professionals come together and work to design a game, the further development of a gamemediate dual learning model calls for a combined effort bringing different perspectives together and explores interdisciplinary issues and topics.

References


Ellis, Rod (2020). Task-based language teaching for beginner-level young learners. Language Teaching for Young Learners, 2(1), 4-27. https://doi.org/10.1075/ltvl.19005.ell


Lopes, Antônio (2020). Linking content and language-integrated learning (CLIL) and task-based language teaching (TBLT) in an effective way: A methodological proposal. Onomázein: Revista de lingüística, filología y traducción de la Pontificia Universidad Católica de Chile, 6, 5-22. https://doi.org/10.7764/onomazein.ne6.01


Included studies for literature review:


Appendix

Table 3
Included publications in this selective literature review

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Included databases</th>
<th>Included studies</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Language Learning and Technology (LLT) V16 (2012)-V26 (current)</td>
<td>None</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Kao (2020)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Pitra &amp; Terlecka-Pacut (2018)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Rasti-Behbahani &amp; Shahbazi (2020)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Reynolds &amp; Kao (2021)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Soyoof et al. (2022)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ReCALL V24 (2012)-V34 (2022)</td>
<td>None</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TESOL Journal + TESOL Quarterly</td>
<td>Azkarai &amp; Agirre (2016)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sydorenko et al (2019)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Computer &amp; Education</td>
<td>Liu &amp; Chu (2010)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Fu et al. (2019)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Teo et al (2022)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Hsu (2017)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other journals identified from Google Scholar</td>
<td>Butler (2018)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Baturay et al. (2022)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Chung &amp; Chang (2017)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Dourda et al (2014)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Lin et al (2018)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>McCollum (2023)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Muntrikaeo &amp; Poonpon (2022)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Theologou &amp; Papadopoulos (2015)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Yuchan (Blanche) Gao, Arizona State University
blanche.gao@asu.edu

EN Yuchan (Blanche) Gao earned her Ph.D. in Learning, Literacies, and Technologies from the Mary Lou Fulton Teachers College at Arizona State University. Her interdisciplinary work lies at the intersection of second language acquisition and pedagogies, learning technologies (with a focus on digital games), and instructional design. She received her BA degree in Linguistics from Southern Illinois University and her MEd degree in Curriculum and Instruction and TESOL Certificate from the University of Virginia. She has worked as a secondary school ESOL instructor and curriculum director, as well as a university instructor, in the United States and China.

ES Yuchan (Blanche) Gao recibió su doctorado en Aprendizaje, Alfabetismos y Tecnologías del Mary Lou Fulton Teachers College at Arizona State University en los Estados Unidos. Su trabajo interdisciplinario queda en la intersección de la adquisición de idiomas segundas y pedagogías, aprendizaje de las tecnologías (enfocado en juegos digitales), y diseño instruccional. Recibió su bachillerato en Lingüística de la Southern Illinois University, y su maestría en Currículo e Instrucción y certificado en TESOL (enseñanza de inglés como segunda lengua) en la University of Virginia. Ha trabajado como maestra de inglés como lengua secundaria y directora de currículo en la escuela secundaria y también como instructora a nivel universitario en los Estados Unidos y China.

IT Yuchan (Blanche) Gao ha conseguito il dottorato di ricerca in Apprendimento, Alfabetizzazione e Tecnologie al Mary Lou Fulton Teachers College presso l’Arizona State University. Il suo lavoro interdisciplinare si trova all’intersezione tra l’acquisizione e le pedagogie di una seconda lingua, le tecnologie di apprendimento (con un focus sui giochi digitali) e la progettazione didattica. Ha conseguito la laurea in Linguistica presso la Southern Illinois University, il master in Curriculum e Istruzione e il TESOL presso la University of Virginia. Ha lavorato come docente di inglese come lingua seconda e direttrice del curriculum in una scuola secondaria e anche come docente in università negli Stati Uniti e in Cina.
A call for critical and open pedagogies in Spanish heritage language instruction: Students as knowledge producers of Open Educational Resources (OERs)

Inés Vañó García
Saint Anselm College

Received 15 August 2022; accepted after revisions 16 April 2023

ABSTRACT

This paper stresses the urgent need to implement critical and open pedagogies in language teaching, especially in the Spanish heritage language classroom. Language courses are often compulsory in secondary and higher education and typically employ traditional pedagogical models that are structured by grammar and/or communication tasks. This study introduces how heritage language teaching emerged as a field of study in the United States and offers a brief overview of critical and open pedagogies and their connection to open educational resources. This paper then introduces critical and open pedagogies to teaching Spanish as a heritage language, followed by a critical look at the existing Spanish teaching material. As an alternative to this material, this article shares a project titled “Discovering El Barrio“ which addresses an innovative and productive pedagogical practice carried out by a Spanish heritage language class at Lehman College, CUNY. In this project, Spanish heritage language learners (HLL) became producers of authentic teaching and learning materials for second language (L2) Spanish learners.

Key words: SPANISH HERITAGE LANGUAGE, LANGUAGE IDEOLOGIES, CRITICAL PEDAGOGY, OPEN EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES (OERs)

Palabras clave: ESPAÑOL COMO LENGUA DE HERENCIA, IDEOLOGÍAS LINGÜÍSTICAS, PEDAGOGÍA CRÍTICA, RECURSOS EDUCATIVOS ABIERTOS (REA)

Parole chiave: SPAGNOLO COME LINGUA EREDITARIA, IDEOLOGIE LINGUISTICHE, PEDAGOGIA CRITICA, RISORSE DIDATTICHE APERTE
1. Introduction: The teaching of Spanish in the United States

Despite changes in the United States bilingual education policies over the years, these policies continue to reproduce monoglossic ideologies (Wiley & García, 2016), casting Spanish as a language of poverty used by Latines\(^1\) and as a negotiable resource used by bilinguals in the United States. Language education policies and practices do not allow U.S. Latines to negotiate Spanish as a resource; rather, they are encouraged to shift to English, leaving not only Spanish behind but also any prospects in the Spanish/English bilingual market as well (García & Mason, 2008). Despite its constant presence in the United States, Spanish has mostly been shaped as immigrant and foreign in education as well as social contexts (Lozano, 2018), thus ignoring a heteroglossic perspective and reinforcing monoglossic teaching paradigms, with direct consequences not just in the educational spaces but also in the work force. In a recent analysis by Lara Alonso and Laura Villa, based on the reproduction of the discursive trope of language profit in the United States, they state, “The marginalized position of Latinx in the social structure and the racialization of their linguistic practices result in a linguistic exploitation that remains unchallenged in the US” (2020, p. 37). In order to acknowledge that Spanish is not a foreign language in the United States, there is the urgent need to engage with critical pedagogy frameworks to challenge the teaching and learning paradigms that continue to reproduce these monoglossic ideologies which conceive Spanish as a static object of study with no consideration to the political nature of the language itself.

The presence of heritage languages (HL) and heritage language learners (HLL) in the educational system in the United States is not a new development (Fishman, 2001; Roca, 1997; Valdés, 2005). Nevertheless, it was not until the 1970s that there was an explicit reference to HLL from many language teaching organizations. After the Bilingual Education Act was signed in 1968, an article was published in the Modern Language Journal following the annual meeting of the American Association of Teachers of Spanish and Portuguese (AATSP) in New York City, titled “Spanish and Portuguese Cease to Be Foreign” (Teschner, 1973). This was the first time that both language organizations, the AATSP along with the Modern Language Association (MLA), officially addressed the fact that there were Spanish-speaking learners within the “foreign” language classroom and, therefore, teachers would have to be aware of their different educational needs (Potowski & Carreira, 2004). Consequently, as Gutiérrez explains, “these language learners require a pedagogical perspective that values their backgrounds and experiences instead of treating them as beginners” (1997, p. 34).

Despite the diversity of their student populations, some colleges and high schools did not offer heritage language courses until the turn of the 21st century. However, since then, there has been an exponential growth of Spanish HL program throughout universities in the United States (Beaudrie & Fairclough, 2012). By the end of 1990s, there was a re-emergence of heritage language as a field of study within the academic setting (Wiley, 2005). This was the turning point for heritage language education, with the first of many national conferences (the first one in 1999, followed by the second one in 2002) and specialized publications, such as the Heritage Language Journal. And yet, the increased visibility also brought new questions and challenges\(^2\).

In spite of the permanent presence of and exposure to Spanish in the United States, it is a language that mostly remains labeled as immigrant and foreign (Del Valle & García, 2013; Lozano, 2018), and there is a tendency to construct its teaching as the teaching of a foreign language (Alonso, 2006; Pomerantz & Schwartz, 2011). As advocates for critical pedagogies in language teaching demonstrate through their work, the teaching of Spanish, or any other language, as a heritage language differs from its teaching as a second language. For further insights, see the work of Daniel Villa (1996, 2002, 2005), Jennifer Leeman (2005, 2014, 2018), Glenn Martinez (2003, 2016), Sara Beaudrie (2015), along with Damian Vergara Wilson (2021) and Claudia Holguín Mendoza (2018, 2021), among others. The commitment of these scholars has demonstrated the need to contextualize and critically examine historical constructions, as well as the social and political implications of academic and standard language ideologies and linguistic hierarchies (Aparicio, 1997).

This article gives an overview of the development of the teaching of Spanish as a heritage language within the United States and advocates for the application of critical and open pedagogies within the field. In

\(^1\) My intention is to make visible the use of ”c” as an alternative to ”x” for language inclusivity in Spanish since the latter has encountered some political resistance and the former allows for greater legibility.

\(^2\) Although it is outside the scope of this paper, since I am advocating for critical and open approaches to language teaching, I would like to acknowledge the problematic labeling of “heritage learner/language.” While in the field of HL education this label has been settled, this terminology has been contested in bilingual education. For further discussion of this point see García (2005) and Van Deusen-Scholl (2003).
addition to this brief history about the emergence of the field, I also present a critical consideration of the instruction materials available for language instruction. Finally, I share “Discovering El Barrio” as a case study of a project born in response to this need to challenge the traditional pedagogies in language teaching to HL. This project illustrates critical and open pedagogies within language instruction where HLL students created, produced, and edited videos based in East Harlem, resulting in publicly accessible authentic teaching and learning materials for L2 Spanish learners beyond the physical classroom. After a description of the project, its methodology, and its scaffolded delivery, I conclude with a reflection about its affordances and constraints, along with further directions to consider for replicating and enhancing the project.

2. Spanish heritage language teaching: An overview

Guadalupe Valdés (1981) was one of the first scholars to take action on the topic of Spanish HLL (also known as Spanish for Native Speakers, or SNS) within the classroom environment. She pointed out that Spanish could not be treated as a foreign language in the United States and drew attention to the subtractive and discriminatory teaching theories and strategies of the time. Valdés compared the teaching of Spanish to the teaching of English and advocated for teaching Spanish as a native language. Valdés called on language instructors to end discriminatory approaches that seek to replace non-standard varieties with standard ones, and instead, recognize the legitimacy of all linguistic varieties.

Sergio Loza and Sara Beaudrie’s introduction to their book (2022) provides a concise historical overview of Spanish HL teaching practices. They chronologically differentiate three waves: the first wave (1981-1999), the second wave (2000-2012) and the third wave (2012-2022). The first wave reinforced monolingual ideologies with an approach that sidelined or even eliminated the multiple contributions of U.S. Latines from any intellectual, cultural, and linguistic perspective within the higher education setting (Loza & Beaudrie, 2022, p. 5). On the contrary, the second wave evolved to include the “development and implementation of sociolinguistically informed pedagogies” (p. 6) and on increasing students’ linguistic repertoire, and/or improving their standardized versions of the language. In other words, the second wave sought to familiarize students with a more formal and academic variety of the language than that which they already speak at home. According to this approach, students who are speakers of non-prestige varieties acquire the more prestigious one, standard variety through education with a language-as-a-resource goal since the language functions as a tool to gain academic and professional success in the future (Beaudrie, Ducar & Potowski, 2014; Ricento, 2005). In addition to the acquisition of this prestige variety, the term “appropriateness” comes into play in order to validate students’ language use in certain contexts. This is sometimes illustrated through analogies between language use and clothing—for instance, it is appropriate to wear a bathing suit when you go swimming but not when you go to a wedding (Potowski, 2016). The understanding that the “variety” that one speaks depends on a specific context upholds the status of prestige varieties, including the standard one (Gutiérrez, 1997). Beaudrie’s findings (2015), based on the analysis of Spanish HL syllabi at a national level, illustrate how pedagogical changes take place gradually since teachers/instructors at the time were still imputing the standard language ideology in their SHL courses (p. 15).

In the global context that we inhabit, Claire Kramsch (2006) calls for a language teaching pedagogy that strives to move beyond the goal of communicative competence (i.e., Communicative Language Teaching, or CLT approach). Taking into account social and economic inequalities as well as historicities—past, present and future—she advocates for symbolic competence: “language learners are not just communicators and problem solvers, but whole personas with hearts, bodies, and minds, with memories, fantasies, loyalties, identities” (p. 251). Within this context, the 2007 MLA report represented a crucial moment with its explicitly acknowledgment of the need to aim for a “translingual and transcultural competence” in language teaching. The report emphasizes how international borders are transformed and reinvented by advances in new technologies and suggests that the objectives of language classes can no longer be understood as foreign. However, as Jennifer Leeman and Ellen Serafini (2016) point out, this report continues to envision students as monolingual speakers gaining proficiency in a target language, a language based on an idealized standard variety. Leeman and Serafini offer a sociolinguistic perspective on teaching HL, providing a list of concepts to be incorporated by teachers and students (i.e., linguistic variation, language attitudes and ideologies, contact language phenomenon). Leeman and Serafini also offer task examples that illustrate the pedagogical practices that truly promotes translingual competence.
This sociolinguistic approach illustrates the need to problematize the normative assumptions that are taken for granted, examine the notion of power associated with them, and interrogate how they operate at linguistic and extra-linguistic levels in different contexts and social practices by establishing the relevant connections with issues of identity and agency (Pennycook, 2001). Language(s) are more than a simple set of linguistic norms, and critical approaches to language teaching must be aware that these norms are conventional and based on social consensus. Consequently, although our social practices tend toward normativity, our pedagogical practices must question them. The idealized notion of standard language is, in itself, a language ideology that is constructed by specific agents within concrete sociohistorical processes (Lippi-Green, 2011; Milroy & Milroy, 1991). From early on, Daniel Villa (1996) challenged the notion of the existence of a "standard variety" of Spanish, and Glenn Martínez's (2003) provided a perspective that problematized the status of the language itself by questioning the power dynamics behind social stratification. The beginning of the 21st century, with the work of Leeman (2005) and Martínez (2003), ushered in a "critical turn" in language teaching. This third wave (Loza & Beaudrie, 2022) constitutes a step forward, not just from a pedagogical standpoint but also at a broader social level which targets students' consciousness. This approach seeks to highlight the stratification of dialects within the social structure and the power implications upholding the notion of a standard or prestige variety. This third wave is characterized by scholars in the HL field developing a critical approach to language teaching (Pascual y Cabo & Prada, 2016). This wave includes work on HL curricular design and anti-racist pedagogies (Beaudrie, Amezcua & Loza, 2021; Lacorte & Magro 2021), and the institutionalization and HL program direction (Beaudrie & Loza, 2021; Carreira, 2017).

Alongside this approach, José Del Valle (2014) posits that it is necessary to think about the social and political positions that shape teachers’ pedagogical practices. He emphasizes the importance of being aware of factors such as ideological forces, institutional requirements, the teacher’s decisions about dialectal choices, among many others, all of which encourage students to become conscious of the situation. Building on this line of work on developing students’ awareness, Leeman and Martínez’s research points to the Critical Language Awareness (CLA) approaches and its curricular development within HL education (Holguín Mendoza, 2018, 2021; Holguín Mendoza, Davis, & Weise, 2018). Leeman’s (2005, 2014) interdisciplinarity pedagogical perspective for Spanish HL includes disciplines such as literature, film and cultural studies, anthropology, and sociolinguistics. Above all, it highlights the necessity of developing students’ agency and critical awareness. This approach tasks instructors with “envisioning the classroom as a politicized space in which students’ lived experiences as US Latinx bilinguals are surfaced, recognized as legitimate, and contextualized within larger societal powers structures” (Loza & Beaudrie, 2022, p. 9). Following this framework, it must be understood that languages are not natural units, instead they are social constructions; languages are politically defined categories (García & Otheguy, 2015; Otheguy, García, & Reid, 2015). According to this argument, this project is situated within a critical pedagogical framework that aims to:

- help students critically understand their own lives and worlds, develop agency in making their own language choices, and participate in the building of a more democratic society, educators must take the relationship between language and sociopolitical issues explicit, provide opportunities for students to examine and interrogate dominant linguistics practices and hierarchies, and encourage students to explore the ways language can be used to perform a wide range of social functions and identity work (Leeman, 2005, p. 36).

In this way, by emphasizing the need to think about the political, historical and social experiences that shape the pedagogical practice of the teacher, language is understood as more than a communicative tool. Its symbolic value allows it to be placed in a social context that affords critical examination of the roles of the speakers, the language itself, and its function within society.

3. Pedagogical framework(s): Critical/open pedagogies & open educational resources (OERs)

Critical approaches to teaching are not a new phenomenon. Within the context of the United States, Brazilian educator Paulo Freire (1921-1997) is well known for his critique of the “banking system” of education that describes the one-way system in which students assimilate the knowledge provided by the teacher (Freire, 1994). Contrary to a “banking” model that consists mostly of memorization and drill practice, Freire advocates for a “problem-solving” methodology where “people develop their power to perceive critically the way they exist in the world with which and in which they find themselves; they come to see the world not as a static...
reality, but as a reality in process, in transformation” (Freire, 1994, p. 64). As educator Luisa Parra illustrates through her Spanish teaching experience, these pedagogical frameworks create opportunities for students to expand on their social consciousness and reflect on their positionality to act and have an impact for the possibility of a more inclusive future (Parra, 2013, p. 257).

Within this framework of critical pedagogy, there is an emphasis on dialogue and community building, fostering students’ inquiry and agency and motivating students to be active critical thinkers. As Jesse Stommel explains, “Critical Pedagogy is concerned less with knowing and more with a voracious not-knowing. It is an on-going and recursive process of discovery” (2014). These critical pedagogy methods offer new possibilities, especially if we consider affordances of digital spaces to do this work. In this vein, many scholars have highlighted the shared aims of critical pedagogies and open pedagogies, which seek to harness the power of digital technologies to expand opportunities for teaching and learning (Rosen & Smale, 2015; Stommel, 2014). According to Robin DeRosa and Rajiv Jhangiani, open pedagogy

is a site of praxis, a place where theories about learning, teaching, technology, and social justice enter into a conversation with each other and inform the development of educational practices and structures. This site is dynamic, contested, constantly under revision, and resists static definitional claims (2017, para. 2).

While both terms share the same foundations and, as indicated, their hybridity could make them synonymous, it is worth reinforcing their shared vision for the possibilities offered by technology and open digital tools: for this reason, the term Open Digital Pedagogy is useful as well. As Jody Rosen and Maura Smale explain,

Open digital pedagogy is the use of cost-free, publicly available online tools and platforms by instructors and students for teaching, learning, and communicating in support of educational goals, can [...] facilitate student access to existing knowledge, and empower them to critique it, dismantle it, and create new knowledge (2015, para. 2).

Although we may encounter multiple explanations for these terms, many of them emphasize and embrace the push for Open Educational Resources (OERs), as the above definition demonstrates. Despite the fact that in most cases OERs are understood and praised as easily accessible and free materials, the notion of “open” entails different layers of accessibility, frequently supported by Creative Commons licenses, giving the educational materials multiple degrees for being reused, remixed, revised, redistribute and retained. Aside from cost, the use of OERs offers a path for pedagogical experimentation and changes, including many creative possibilities that allow collaboration between students and faculty to create and design pedagogical materials for intended courses and specific purposes (DeRosa & Robinson, 2017, p. 116). These approaches facilitate the expansion of teaching and learning beyond the classroom where students can be thought of as knowledge creators, having an audience and an impact on their institutions and communities.

Regarding existing Spanish teaching OERs, most instruction material has replicated the same grammar-based teaching and learning practices from textbooks with traditional methodologies based on drills, filling in the blanks, and closed-question activities. These resources often focus on teaching the core skills (speaking, listening, reading, and writing) with a multiplicity of approaches that cover grammar, vocabulary, and culture. Nevertheless, while these traditional paradigms remain predominant, there are some exceptions. These materials do not simply focus on acquiring the necessary and/or demanded linguistics skills; they also cover metalinguistic issues and facilitate interdisciplinary collaborations. For instance, The Center for Open Educational Resources and Language Learning (COERLL) 3 is one of the sixteen National Foreign Language Resources Center institutes among language educators that mainly focuses on the creation and dissemination of OERs. More concrete initiatives include The Foreign Languages and the Literary in the Everyday (FLLITE) 4, which is sponsored by the same center as COERLL. FLLITE provides a collaborative space that builds on a “multilitteracies” approach and emphasizes language play in second language literacy. Another initiative is the Empowering Learners of Spanish material led by Claudia Holguín Mendoza and her team that builds on critical pedagogies to introduce sociolinguistic issues (Vaño García, 2019). Additionally, there is MI-BRIDGE, a task-based, open-access Spanish language curriculum that centers Blackness in Latin America and Black language learners, funded by the National Endowment from the Humanities (Baralt, Clemons, Anya & Gómez, 2022).

---

3 For more information: http://www.coerll.utexas.edu/coerll/
4 For more information: https://fllite.org/.
3.1. A critical look at Spanish instruction material

Within the pedagogical framework of second languages, textbooks are considered to be artifacts that transmit specific knowledge to students. In other words, they are seen as tools that teachers/instructors use to communicate a message to their students. Textbooks are "central classroom literature that drives instructional scope and sequence and generates the goals and objectives of second language acquisition" (Pardiñas-Barnes, 1998, p. 230). According to Renate Schulz (1990), critiques of second language textbooks in the United States are based primarily on four aspects: (1) the need to reduce grammatical content, (2) a change from a grammatical organization of syllabi to a more functional organization, (3) the need to include authentic material, and (4) the creation of content that conveys an intellectual challenge for students. Spanish textbooks are no exception. According to Cubillos (2014), "textbooks frequently dictate the content, sequence and pace of our language curricula, and their influence expands even to the teaching methodology deployed by language faculty in their classrooms" (p. 206). Thus, textbooks become the primary instrument within the classroom, dictating content, curricular sequence, and the teaching methodology.

The study by Víctor Arizpe and Benigno Aguirre (1987), which covers seven Spanish textbooks published between 1975-1984 at the elementary university level, analyzes how the representation of Mexican, Cuban, and Puerto Rican ethnic groups is presented with excessive cultural simplification and, therefore, with the frequent use of racial and ethnic stereotypes. Arnulfo Ramírez and Joan Hall (1990), focusing on books intended for the teaching of the Spanish language in secondary school, examine how these textbooks consider topics of abstract content, without human interaction, and without consideration of social class issues. Using the same assessment framework, Deborah Herman (2007) focuses on four other contemporary Spanish textbooks, also used by high schools in the United States, and advocates for a pedagogical change in language instruction that allows a framework for promoting reflection and critical inquiry.

In another study, Ali Zaidi (2010) examines how characters are represented in three Spanish textbooks, noting the absence of historical and sociological contextualization. This absence perpetuates socioeconomic inequalities that, at the same time, perpetuate a hierarchy based on colonial imperialism. Taking these conclusions into account, Hugo Hortiguera's work (2011) examines the audio-visual materials that accompany language textbooks, concluding that: these videos do not question these representations, on the contrary, they confirm and verify them in the Spanish classroom itself. By means of a complex device of generalizations, abstractions, omissions, contrasts or inferences, the other is relegated to a folkloric space and identified with values of frivolity, entertainment, and hedonism (Hortiguera, 2011, “Conclusions,” para. 3) (translations, unless otherwise indicated, are my own).

More recently, the work of Lillie Padilla and Rosti Vana (2022) discusses the erasure of Afro-Latinx representation in Spanish textbooks, revealing how Black students are significantly underrepresented in college language programs. These erasures demonstrate the pressing need for more inclusive and equitable language teaching practices that include all students, making the work on Critical Race Pedagogy by Uju Anya (2021) and the MI BRIDGE OER curriculum that centers Blackness in Latin America and Black language learners (Baralt, Clemons, Anya & Gómez, 2022) especially important.

A critical approach takes into account the conditions of production in which the text is conceived as a cultural artifact (Apple & Christian-Smith, 1991). As can be seen in this approach, the book can never have a neutral value, since it has an economic and symbolic value within a market: they are at once the results of political, economic, and cultural activities, battles, and compromises. They are conceived, designed, and authored by real people with real interests. They are published within the political and economic constraints of markets, and what texts mean and how they are used are fought over by communities with distinctly different commitments and by teachers and students as well. (Apple & Christian-Smith, 1991, p. 1-2).

Bearing in mind this perspective in which books are also economic goods with a value within a linguistic and economic market (Bourdieu, 1991), we consider textbooks as organizers of the knowledge system of society. That is to say, that the information and material that is included is considered legitimate and true by its producers and receivers, constructing, producing and reproducing a determined vision of both linguistic and social reality. It is within this perspective that we find the work of Leeman and Martínez (2007), in which a critical analysis of linguistic ideologies is carried out in the discourses of the Spanish manuals for Spanish HL published between 1920 and 1950. What separates this study from the previous ones is the...
consideration of the market of production of materials, which makes visible the highly normative linguistic-ideological regimes mobilized by social, economic, historical, and political causes, and which necessarily have implications in pedagogical practices.

4. “Discovering El Barrio”: Students as knowledge producers

Heritage language teaching requires critical consideration of historical and social contexts. In the past, pedagogical models and instructional materials for teaching Spanish, especially HL Spanish, have been found to lack these aspects. Textbooks overlook cultural and linguistic differences and provide content that guides instructors towards more traditional, banking models of education. As an example of ways to counter this tendency, the “Discovering El Barrio” project applies critical and open pedagogies models in a Spanish HL course. As part of these critical teaching methods, students contributed to the development of OER in the form of HL teaching audio-visual materials. This approach acknowledges that students are producers of knowledge, and by providing an alternative to the traditional instructional textbooks, a priority is given to material that incorporates social and historical authentic contexts and engage all Spanish speakers.

This project was conducted during the fall semester of 2017 at Lehman College, The City University of New York (CUNY). Located in the Bronx, Lehman College is one of the twenty-five public colleges within the CUNY system and is federally recognized as a Hispanic-Serving Institution (HSI). Students who enrolled in SPA 114: Elementary Spanish for Heritage Speakers II (SPA 114) were placed in class in one of two ways: either they completed the previous language class (Spanish for Heritage Speakers I), or they placed via a placement test. This test is not only based on proficiency; it also contains questions regarding students’ background information in order to know more about their language experience. In this institution, 90-95% of students are taking SPA 114 in order to satisfy the language requirement of the college, and only a small minority decide to minor in Spanish.

By the end of the semester, students were expected to be able to: (1) develop their agency and feel comfortable making their own language choices; (2) question and think critically about the connection between language and power in order to challenge the established societal status quo; (3) question how (our) linguistic practices influence current socio-political issues; (4) develop their literacy skills: reading (read critically, interpret, and discuss texts from different genres) and writing (write descriptive and argumentative compositions, become aware of the academic conventions within institutions); and (5) improve and strengthen technology/computer skills using software that combines text, images, audio and other media.

The SPA 114 course was set up through CUNY Academic Commons, a WordPress site available only to students registered in this class. The site enhanced students’ engagement with the required readings, discussion, feedback, and community building; through the class website students were able to collaboratively read and annotate the readings before coming to class, and continue the dialogue, reflective practice, and discussion after the class. In this way, the course was student-driven through questions and provocations posted by students, as well as through discussions generated and moderated by them. Each week, two to three students were in charge of annotating the reading(s) and guiding the class discussion. The annotation was done through Hypothes.is, an open source tool that allows users to annotate a text collaboratively and digitally. This annotation opportunity fosters students’ writing skills and invited them to use their whole linguistic repertoire, while also developing critical thinking skills. During the semester, students were also required to create blog posts. Blogging was another low-stakes writing assignment where students used their linguistic repertoire, and had the opportunity to create multimodal responses and comments by adding hyperlinks, pictures, and/or videos.

“Discovering El Barrio” is an innovative pedagogical practice that enabled Spanish HLL to become producers of audio-visual teaching and learning materials for L2 Spanish learners. Taking El Barrio (i.e., Spanish Harlem, East Harlem) as a starting point, HLL students were able to discover, explore, map and video-record different places of the area, building connections within diverse communities outside the classroom.

---

5 Although the actual course with student work is not publicly available, a sample site has been created with access to the syllabus, readings, requirements and other components of the course along the scaffolding and handouts of the project with the final artifacts: https://spaheritage.commons.gc.cuny.edu/.

6 For more information: https://web.hypothesis.is/

7 Both WordPress and Hypothes.is are open-source software, meaning that they are free in two senses: “not only do users have the right to use the software, but users, developers, and re-developers have the rights to access, manipulate, break, rebuild the original code to fix bugs, add features, or create new projects” (Shaffer, 2013).
setting. This semester-long project emphasized a decentered classroom perspective, and these methodologies promoted HLL communicative competences as well as cultural and socio-political awareness in a local context. Students were actively involved in formative and summative reflection about their work since they were critically and continuously engaged during the process from design and research to problem solving. Finally, the authenticity of the project was accomplished by students’ voices and choices, and made available as OER through CUNY Academic Commons.

This project followed place-based and task-based methodologies. These methodologies are student-centered and illustrate critical pedagogical practices through critical reflection, collaborative writing, development of problem-solving skills, promotion of inquiry, and active and conscious engagement in the creative process. Differing from grammatical or textbook based instruction, this method of Spanish HL education engages students in an experiential learning project, providing opportunities for exploration of the Spanish language and linguistic practices in a real-world context (Torres, 2022; Torres & Baralt, 2022). According to Julio C. Rodríguez, from the Language & Technology and National Foreign Language Resource Center (NFLRC) at University of Hawaii at Manoa, the key criteria listed in the left column of Table 1 below characterize Project-based Language Learning (PBLL). The right column offers examples of how this specific project addressed the criteria:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Project-based language learning (PBLL) criteria</th>
<th>Students as creators of OERs: Discovering El Barrio</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(1) Key knowledge, understanding and success skills</td>
<td>The project addressed the 21st Century Skills according to ACTFL: communication, collaboration, critical thinking and problem solving, creativity and innovation, information literacy, media literacy, technology literacy, flexibility and adaptability, initiative and self-direction, social and cross-cultural skills, productivity and accountability, leadership and responsibility.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(2) The challenge</td>
<td>This project is framed around a challenge or open-ended question: Spanish HLL must select, present and design audiovisual material to Spanish L2 from a local point of view (East Harlem).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(3) Sustained inquiry</td>
<td>This project encourages HLL to continuously generate questions about form and meaning that promote linguistic and cultural connections, at the same time they are learning to search and use digital and non-digital resources that help them solve those questions.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(4) Authenticity</td>
<td>Although authenticity has been discussed from different perspectives in the second language acquisition field, in this project it speaks to the context of the language use (East Harlem), as well as the final product, created by HLL through their experiences.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(5) Students voice and choice</td>
<td>Since motivation is a crucial aspect in language learning, this project creates the opportunity for learners’ input in the choice of topic and the evolution of the project. At the same time, by creating the need for interaction, Spanish HLLs who may not feel comfortable speaking Spanish as creators within the project establish a connection between the language and their linguistic and cultural background, while building an environment where they feel comfortable with the language repertoire they speak.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(6) Reflection</td>
<td>Through blog posts and class/group discussions, participants (both HLL and the instructor) have opportunities to reflect and provide possible ways to explore, discover and review their thoughts and beliefs about language learning.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(7) Critique and revision</td>
<td>This project created different spaces for corrective feedback (from other students and the instructor), and also for the re-thinking of ideas and products throughout the process.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(8) Public product</td>
<td>The material produced by students is accessible as OER.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4.1. Stage 1. Reflection and evaluation of second language audiovisual materials

As an initial task, students were exposed to different audio-visual materials for L2 Spanish learners. These audio-visual materials were extracted from the textbook Aventuras, by Vistas Higher Learning (used in
several L2 courses at the same institution). These videos present cultural aspects of the Spanish-speaking communities while introducing new lexicon and reviewing linguistic competencies. Students were able to watch, discuss, and analyze these videos. In small groups students engaged in a critical analysis of these materials as means to identify dominant ideologies and representations embedded within them.

The first video, “Bienvenida, Marissa” is the first episode of a telenovela that tells the story of a group of students studying abroad in Mexico. As it can be observed from Figure 1, each chapter of the textbook presents a different episode of this telenovela following the same structure. The textbook provides a photo-based summary of the episode along with a list of characters on the left side, a “useful expression” list on the right, and some guided activities to check comprehension (i.e., true or false, fill in the blanks, and closed-ended questions). In this specific first episode, Marissa, a U.S. college student from Wisconsin arrives to La Ciudad de Mexico for her study abroad program and has the chance to meet the family with whom she is going to stay.

![Figure 1. Screenshot of the online textbook](image)

The second video that we used for this project is called “Encuentros en la plaza.” The video was taken from a section in the first chapter called “Flash Cultura.” The content of each video is linked to the main theme of the chapter, in this case, introductions. The video, mainly in English, is based in Buenos Aires, Argentina, and after a quick tour around the different “plazas” of the city, it shows a group of friends meeting for the first time. At the end of this video, the reporter recapitulates the content with the following words: “We saw that the plaza is an important center of cities and towns in the Spanish-Speaking world. That Spanish speakers often engage in more physical contact between themselves than Americans. And that if you ever travel to Latin America or Spain you had better be ready for some very warm greetings” (Blanco & Donley, 2017).

After watching the videos, students completed the open-ended questions. Students first shared their viewpoints and opinions in small groups and then discussed them as a whole class. Students were surprised by the lack of authenticity of the materials presented together with the situations portrayed. They were able to point out how they felt the characters, situations, and/or social practices were unrelatable to them. Students were able to talk about multiple issues concerning how the traditional U.S. college student is represented (i.e., a white, blond girl from Wisconsin staying with an upper-middle class family in Mexico), along with college experiences and expectations (study abroad programs as essential within college degree), and multiple positive and negative stereotypes and generalizations regarding Spanish speakers. Moreover, this assignment had pedagogical implications since students had the opportunity to reflect on how students in their own institution were exposed to Spanish teaching instruction material that represented and emphasized the Spanish language and its speakers as “foreign,” instead of offering a more “local” perspective based on the linguistic diversity in New York City.
4.2. Stage 2. Place-based assignment

To incorporate an experiential, active learning experience as a class, students visited Spanish Harlem. The assignment was scaffolded in three sub-stages: students first carried out some research about the neighborhood, then conducted field work by visiting the area, and finally shared and reflected on their experience.

4.2.1. Pre-visit research

During class, students researched East Harlem. Working in small groups, students read and investigated the history of this neighborhood and the relevance of different locations, especially places that they wanted to know more about or locations that could be of interest to themselves and/or students learning Spanish. Although students working in small groups had the freedom to start their research from scratch, in future projects it would be beneficial for the instructor to provide information regarding the neighborhood, such as a list of videos and/or articles as a point of entry.

Students shared what they had learned about the neighborhood in blog posts. Then, each group came up with a list of places to explore during their visit, and developed a fairly extensive list of locations that included a broad list of restaurants, several churches, museums, schools, non-profit organizations, and food courts. Students noted that they chose these locations because they could take pictures there and also have the opportunity to interact with community members. They then discussed different options as a group in order to make sure that all the groups were not visiting the same locations.

4.2.2. East Harlem / El Barrio

Following the research phase, the class visited East Harlem and each group was able to explore and discover the different pre-selected locations (including grocery stores, bodegas, restaurants, cafés, museums, churches, libraries, music shops, cultural centers, bookstores, and murals, among many others). Students took pictures and videos in order to share the information and experience with their classmates when they reported on their visit on the classroom blog. This reflection assignment allowed students to share their experiences with their classmates, not just through writing, but also by sharing the media they collected during the visit. Although many students’ homes were not as far away as one might think considering the parameters of the city, many students were not familiar with the particular sites they explored. They reported how it was the first time learning about the existence of specific places, monuments, museums as well as Hispanic restaurants. Here are some excerpts from students’ blog entries:

[Nuestras expectativas relacionadas con “El Barrio” eran diferentes a las que pudimos ver. Pensábamos que al llegar nos encontraríamos con algo feo, paredes con graffiti, las calles sucias y otro estilo de vida, pero no fue así. En Harlem visitamos una Iglesia Católica, una cancha de jugar baloncesto donde vimos las paredes pintadas con un arte hermoso. Visitamos una florería y finalmente fuimos a un teatro]

[Nuestro viaje al este de east Harlem “El barrio” fue disfrutar plenamente, pudimos ir a lugares donde hablamos con las personas del vecindario. Les preguntamos cómo era el área. Y lo que les gusta de eso. Como grupo, queríamos visitar y conectar con las personas local. Un buen lugar para pasar un buen tiempo es “el museo del Barrio” localizado en el 1230 5th Ave, New York, NY 10029. mientras caminábamos por el museo escuchamos tocar instrumentos de música, nos paramos a mirar y, mientras un grupo de músicos se detenían para descansar, le preguntamos a uno de ellos por su tiempo y hablamos con José, el tipo de la camisa gris.]

8 [Our expectations regarding “El Barrio” were different from what we saw. We thought that when we arrived we would find something ugly, walls with graffiti, dirty streets and a different lifestyle, but that was not the case. In Harlem we visited a Catholic Church, a basketball court where we saw the walls painted with beautiful art. We visited a flower shop (florería) and finally went to a theater].

[Our trip to the east of East Harlem “El Barrio” was thoroughly enjoyable, we were able to go to places where we talked to people in the neighborhood. We asked them what the area was like. And what they like about it. As a group, we wanted to visit and connect with the local people. A good place to spend some quality time is “el museo del Barrio” located at 1230 5th Ave, New York, NY 10029. As we walked through the museum we heard musical instruments playing, we stopped to watch and, as a group of musicians stopped to rest, we asked one of them for his time and talked to Jose, the guy in the gray shirt].
4.2.3. Sharing ideas / Puesta en común:
In the following session, we spent time discussing the visit as well as the blogs they shared on the classroom site. Students were very responsive, giving feedback to other groups and sharing possible ideas. After our discussion, every group was able to narrow down their options and had one or two locations to focus on for their video.

4.3. Stage 3. Let’s be creative: Lights! Camera! Action!
Each video had to showcase an aspect and/or location from Spanish Harlem. The goal was to provide a context in which the viewer (a Spanish L2 student) could learn more details about the background and impact of the Spanish-speaking community in this area from a more authentic, compelling, and engaging perspective. Students edited their final videos by compiling multiple shorter videos, and images, and adding voiceovers as well as music. The suggested time for each video was three to four minutes.

We had an informative introductory session with a videography fellow who taught us recording techniques, tips for interviewing as well as video editing and productions skills using iMovie. Students can use these transferable skills in other coursework and throughout their careers. Students had five weeks to work on their videos. During this setup period, students had to check in with the instructor and report to the class about the progress on their projects on a weekly basis. Although they also had assistance from the videography fellow for technological support, only half of them took advantage of this opportunity.

Videos were presented the last week of classes and students were able to give feedback both in class and through the tool called Vocat⁹. Vocat, an open-source digital tool that has evolved within the CUNY system, facilitates detailed formative and summative feedback on a variety of media types, including video recordings. In this peer-review opportunity students, along the instructor, were able to comment and react to their classmates’ work. This was a chance for students to share their knowledge as experts since all of them had completed the project.

![Snapshot of student feedback in one video using Vocat.](image)

4.4. Stage 4. Curation of the material
This stage entailed some post-production work with the audio-recordings already created by students. The curation process, conducted once the semester was over, aimed to review the audio and visual material used in each video to confirm and ensure the rights to reproduce the material created with the permission required. I focused the work on two of the videos: “Los murales de 'El Barrio’” and “El Museo del Barrio.” First, the introduction of one of the videos was selected to serve as a general introduction in order to maintain consistency in the project itself. Next, I proceeded to search, select, and add music with rights allowing reuse.

---

⁹ For more information: [http://vocat.io/](http://vocat.io/).
then made several cuts in cases where consent was not obtained for interviews, and I updated the credits. I created subtitles, since one of the main goals of this curation process was also to provide a version of the video with Spanish subtitles to ensure accessibility. Finally, some contextual information, suggestions, and resources were added for instructors in case they wished to adapt this material in their classes. A sample site with the CUNY Academic Commons was created to host all of the material.

5. Reflective discussion, pedagogical implications, and further directions

The critical and open pedagogies followed in “Discovering El Barrio” recognized students as knowledge producers from the onset. In the context of the class, students were framed as knowledge producers, active critical thinkers, and researchers who linked scholarship to their local communities, and were able to reflect on the multilingual and multietnic cultural identities and engage in a meaningful way with the public outside the classroom. By moving beyond the traditional final written text-based essay and/or composition, and by conceiving the final artifact as a public facing OER video recording, students were active participants in the decision-making of every scaffolded step of the project. HLL engaged creatively and critically from design and research to meaning negotiation and problem-solving. The learning space was reimagined physically as well as digitally from many perspectives creating anew the power dynamics of the classroom. Students, as learning peers, collaborated and constructed each scaffolded assignment by incorporating their ideas and voices. This step-by-step process shaped the final artifact.

However, it is important to acknowledge that outside of this project, there were other curriculum and content aspects that could not be modified (i.e., grammar topics, quizzes, exams). The pedagogy presented in this piece does not reflect the entire course design, as can be inferred from the sample site previously provided. However, even when some course elements are predefined, interventions like this project provide a significant and necessary entry point to reconsider the pedagogical approach to current language instruction for heritage speakers, and to reflect upon the language instruction material currently published and required in many of our classrooms.

The videos produced by HLL offer a more realistic, authentic, and true-to-life perspective than many standard L2 materials. Topics, places, and issues are more relatable and interconnected to students’ experience attending a public urban higher education institution, and they do not exoticize and/or stereotype Spanish culture in the way that textbooks tend to portray it (Arizpe & Aguirre, 1987; Cubillos, 2014; Hortigüera, 2011; Ramírez & Hall, 1990; Padilla & Vana, 2022; Zaidi, 2010). Students were able to reflect on how language(s) have been constructed to fit into the textbooks and college language classrooms in a very artificial way. This reflection allowed them to explore the social and educational implications of language teaching within their own institution. It is significant that students, as producers of this material, also retain ownership of the work they have created. Within this context of experiential learning, safe teaching and learning spaces were created where students were able to experiment and take risks, giving and welcoming constant feedback from their peers, allowing for collaboration and community building to develop throughout the semester. Additionally, these spaces improved and strengthened technology/computer skills since students acquired digital and transferable skills that they can then use in other courses and throughout their academic and professional careers.

Admittedly, there were compromises that had to be made concerning the tools used in this project. While tools that align with the goals of open critical pedagogy were used whenever possible, a number of issues sometimes resulted in the selection of other kinds of software. For instance, I opted to use iMovie as a video editing tool, even though it is not an example of free and open-source software. This decision was made based on students’ accessibility to the type of computers and software at their own institution, as well as students’ personal mobile devices. Accessibility was an issue consciously questioned during the design, production and post-production of “Discovering El Barrio,” and students were also involved and active participants in the decision-making of these conversations. By making these concerns transparent to students, they, as a community, decided not to make the class WordPress site public (including annotations and discussions), and also determined which Creative Commons license to use for their videos that were made publicly available (namely, the Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 4.0 International license).

The production quality of the video recordings produced as final artifacts do not equal the ones provided by the audio-visual materials that accompany textbooks by multiple publishing companies. However, I do not believe that this is a constraint that negatively affects these public-facing artifacts since current mobile devices provide a more than acceptable recording tool. Although the project required significant time invested
in its design, planning, scaffolding, and curation, by its own nature, the “openness” of this project intends to foster collaboration and community building practices. Educators could easily replicate the project by remixing this assignment and scaffolding design for their own class and/or by reusing, remixing, revising, and redistributing the material created by the students in accordance with the Creative Commons license. For similar future projects, I would suggest structuring the language class under a thematic subtitle, like many English composition courses currently do, since narrowing the theme of the course from the beginning would help frame the scope and teaching approach to students. The content and structure of the class would follow this main subject matter, instead of being organized by different grammatical aspects.

The curriculum of language instruction in general, including HL teaching, is sometimes rigidly structured with little or no room for flexibility and creativity. However, interventions and place-based projects such as this one could be introduced without completely redesigning the entire course. I envision these assignments as the entry point for further critical thinking about challenging the traditional pedagogies of language instruction, and HL in particular. Even if it is not the definite answer to contest the traditional pedagogies, the adoption and creation of OERs could facilitate, and even encourage, the implementation of these critical and open pedagogies in HL teaching in general, and Spanish in particular, thereby creating an environment that fosters inquiry and develops students’ agency and critical awareness.

Acknowledgements

This article is based on my Independent Study for the Interactive Technology and Pedagogy (ITP) Certificate at the Graduate Center (CUNY). I would like to thank Luke Waltzer for his guidance, mentorship, and constructive feedback as my advisor on this project; Laurie Hurson for her practical advice on Open Pedagogy, and her insightful and encouraging feedback; and my students for their creativity, commitment, and engagement. All errors and omissions are, of course, my own.

Funding

The author would like to acknowledge that this project received funding from the Provost Digital Start-Up Innovation Grant from The Graduate Center, The City University of New York (CUNY).

References


Herman, Deborah (2007). It’s a small world after all: from stereotypes to invented worlds in secondary school Spanish textbooks. *Critical Inquiry in Language Studies, 4*(2-3), 2-3. [https://doi.org/10.1080/15427580701389417](https://doi.org/10.1080/15427580701389417)


Holguín Mendoza, Claudia, Davis, Robert, Cabal Jiménez, Munia, Weise, Julie, & León Howarth, Kelley (n.d.). Empowering learners of Spanish. Español Abierto. Retrieved from [https://sites.google.com/a/cas.uoregon.edu/els/home?authuser=0](https://sites.google.com/a/cas.uoregon.edu/els/home?authuser=0)


VAÑÓ GARCÍA


Parra, María Luisa (2013). Expanding language and cultural competence in advanced heritage-and foreign-language learners through community engagement and work with the arts. Heritage Language Journal, 10(2), 253-280. https://doi.org/10.46538/hlj.10.2.7


Torres, Julio, & Baralt, Melissa (2021). El enfoque por tareas en el aprendizaje del español como lengua de herencia. In Diego Pascual y Cabo & Julio Torres (Eds.), Aproximaciones al estudio del español como lengua de herencia (pp. 81-96). Routledge. https://doi.org/10.4324/9780429443657-9


Inés Vañó García, Saint Anselm College
ivanogarcia@anselm.edu

Inés Vañó García (Ph.D., The Graduate Center, CUNY) is an Assistant Professor of Spanish in the Department of Modern Languages and Literatures at Saint Anselm College (NH). Her research focuses on the political history of the teaching of Spanish in the United States. Her work in Digital Humanities and Open Digital Pedagogy led her to participate in multiple interdisciplinary fellowships including the Andrew W. Mellon CUNY Humanities Alliance and New Storytelling: The Research Institute in Digital Ethnic Studies (University of Nebraska-Lincoln, NE). She serves on the editorial collective of the Journal of Interactive Technology and Pedagogy (JITP).

Inés Vañó García (Ph.D., The Graduate Center, CUNY) es profesora asistente de español en el Departamento de Lenguas y Literaturas Modernas de Saint Anselm College (NH). Su investigación se enfoca en la historia política de la enseñanza del español en Estados Unidos. Su trabajo en Humanidades Digitales y Pedagogía Digital Abierta la ha llevado a participar en múltiples becas interdisciplinarias como la Andrew W. Mellon CUNY Humanities Alliance y la New Storytelling: The Research Institute in Digital Ethnic Studies (University of Nebraska-Lincoln, NE). Forma parte del equipo editorial del Journal of Interactive Technology and Pedagogy (JITP).

Inés Vañó García (Ph.D., The Graduate Center, CUNY) è ricercatrice di spagnolo presso il Dipartimento di Lingue e Letterature al Saint Anselm College (NH). La sua ricerca si concentra sulla storia politica dell’insegnamento dello spagnolo negli Stati Uniti. Il suo lavoro nell’ambito degli Studi Umanistici Digitali e della Pedagogia Digitale Aperta le ha permesso di collaborare con molteplici associazioni interdisciplinari, inclusa la Andrew W. Mellon CUNY Humanities Alliance e New Storytelling: The Research Institute in Digital Ethnic Studies (University of Nebraska-Lincoln, NE). Fa parte del collettivo editoriale del Journal of Interactive Technology and Pedagogy (JITP).
AVANCE TRA SINOFOBIA E SINOFILIA: UN’ANALISI DEL DISCORSO MEDIATICO SUI CINESI IN ITALIA AI TEMPI DEL COVID

ANDREA SCIBETTA
Università per Stranieri di Siena

Received 19 March 2023; accepted after revisions 22 June 2023

RESUMEN

Palabras clave: CHINESE DISCOURSE STUDIES, GROUNDED THEORY, ANALISI QUALITATIVA DEL DISCORSO, PANDEMIA COVID-19

This article introduces a qualitative analysis of a corpus of 48 articles, gathered from Italian newspapers (n = 24) and newspapers and/or web portals addressed to Chinese expatriates residing in Italy (n = 24). The main topic of the analysis concerns the impact of the COVID-19 pandemic on the lives of Chinese expatriates and people of Chinese descent in Italy. The methodological framework brings together Grounded Theory (Charmaz, 2006) and Qualitative Content Analysis (Ji & Eun, 2014), using the multidimensional software Nvivo 11, a methodological instrument which has so far been mainly applied in sociology, psychology, and ethnography (Pacifico & Coppola, 2010). Additionally, a further methodological perspective, Chinese Discourse Studies (Shi-xu, 2014), has been taken into consideration in the labeling of conceptual nodes coded through Nvivo. The results contribute to a deeper understanding, from multiple perspectives, of how Covid-19 impacted on the lives of Chinese people and people of Chinese descent in Italy.

Key words: CHINESE DISCOURSE STUDIES, GROUNDED THEORY, QUALITATIVE CONTENT ANALYSIS, COVID-19

Esta contribución tiene como objetivo presentar un análisis cualitativo realizado sobre un corpus de 48 textos periodísticos, recopilados de diarios italianos (n = 24) y periódicos y/o portales web para chinos residentes en Italia (n = 24). El tema principal del análisis alude al impacto de la pandemia de COVID-19 en la vida de los chinos y sinodescendientes en Italia. El marco metodológico del estudio asume un enfoque mixto, que relaciona la Grounded Theory (Charmaz, 2006) y el Qualitative Content Analysis (Ji & Eun, 2014). La herramienta utilizada para poner en práctica este enfoque es el software multifuncional Nvivo 11, programa que hasta el momento ha sido empleado en diversos campos del conocimiento, como la sociología, la psicología y la etnografía (Pacifico & Coppola, 2010). Finalmente, en el proceso de etiquetado de los nodos conceptuales codificados a través de Nvivo, se ha tenido en cuenta otra perspectiva, la de los Chinese Discourse Studies (Shi-xu, 2014). Los resultados contribuyen a una comprensión más profunda, desde múltiples perspectivas, de cómo el Covid-19 impactó en la vida de las personas chinas y de ascendencia china en Italia.

Palabras clave: ESTUDIOS DEL DISCURSO CHINO, GROUNDED THEORY, ANÁLISIS CUALITATIVO DE CONTENIDO, PANDEMIA DE COVID-19

Andrea Scibetta, Università per Stranieri di Siena
scibetta@unistrasi.it

© Scibetta 2023. This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License.
1. Introduzione

Lo scoppio della pandemia da COVID-19 in Cina e la sua rapida diffusione a livello endemico in ogni parte del pianeta ha comportato una situazione emergenziale epocale, accompagnata quasi subito da una vera e propria ondata di sinofobia e atteggiamenti di aperto razzismo, talvolta sfociati in violenze fisiche, in molte aree di insediamento di cinesi d’oltremare (Gao, 2022 *inter alia*). Per dare un’idea della portata di tale irrigidimento nei confronti di cinesi/sinodiscendenti nel mondo, basti pensare che l’undicesima conferenza mondiale della International Society for the Study of Chinese Overseas (ISSCO) è stata dedicata unicamente al tema “Diasporic Futures: Sinophobia, Techno-Political Strife, and the Politics of Care”\(^1\).

Come in tanti altri contesti, anche in Italia si è assistito ad una proliferazione di atteggiamenti razzisti nei confronti delle persone cinesi in concomitanza con lo scoppio della pandemia e, soprattutto, con i primi casi di COVID in Lombardia, in Veneto e in tutto il resto del paese. Varie studiose hanno analizzato da vicino, con una certa rapidità, l’impatto negativo della pandemia su cinesi e sinodiscendenti in Italia, sia da un punto di vista delle stereopercezioni e delle rappresentazioni sociali nei loro confronti, nonché della loro stigmatizzazione come “portatori di virus” (Stafutti, 2020), sia per quanto riguarda la perdita di visibilità e di voce da parte di queste persone in relazione alla loro produzione artistico-culturale con l’arrivo del virus (Pedone, 2020). I temi legati alla sinofobia e agli atteggiamenti razzisti e discriminatori nei confronti di cinesi e sinodiscendenti, sia sul piano verbale che su quello fisico, non sono nuovi nella società italiana (cfr. Atzori, 2021; Bai, 2021; Candido, 2021; *inter alia*). A tali atteggiamenti si accostano spesso rappresentazioni sociali (Moscovici, 2005) derivanti da un discorso mediatico dominante che tende a stereotipare negativamente o a stigmatizzare gruppi di cittadini stranieri, contribuendo a creare immagini distorte dell’alterità (cfr. in particolare Van Dijk, 1991 in merito all’apparato teorico alla base dei fenomeni razzistici nella stampa). Per quanto riguarda, nello specifico, la strettà interrelazione tra media e trasmissione di rappresentazioni sociali connotate negativamente (e potenzialmente razziste) sui cinesi in Italia, si rimanda a Zhang (2019), con particolare riferimento al discorso (tanto pervasivo quanto poco fondato giuridicamente) sull’esistenza di mafie cinesi in Italia, e ai dibattiti pubblici sulla presunta concorrenza sleale delle imprese cinesi in particolare nel distretto tessile di Prato. A tale proposito si reputa interessante prendere in considerazione anche la categoria del “razzismo democratico” (Faso, 2008; Lunaria, 2017), che rispecchia quell’atteggiamento, di carattere più o meno velatamente discriminatorio, di alcuni giornalisti (indipendentemente dall’orientamento politico di riferimento del loro giornale) nei confronti di questioni che riguardano l’immigrazione e la presenza di persone di altre nazionalità in Italia, e che fanno riferimento ad una rete semantica di concetti, come quelli di “etnia” o “culture altre”, che incentivavano distorsioni percettive, esacerbare una retorica del “noi vs. loro” già forte nell’opinione pubblica (cfr. a tale proposito anche Gallissot, Kilani, & Rivera, 2001). Per quanto concerne in modo particolare il tema della sinofobia con l’arrivo del COVID, anche nel discorso politico e in quello mediatico si sono colti subito i riflessi di un irrigidimento nei confronti della Cina e dei cinesi d’oltremare. Un numero rilevante di articoli di quotidiani italiani, infatti, a partire dal mese di gennaio 2020 si è concentrato da un lato a minimizzare episodi di sinofobia che hanno coinvolto anche volti famosi (è diventata celebre in questo senso la battuta razzista di Buffon ad un tifoso cinese il 15 febbraio 2020: “Hai il Corona eh, ti guardo eh? (...) “Cazzo sei di Wuhan?”)\(^2\); dall’altro lato la stampa si è spesso dedicata ad alimentare una visione di “mistero” attorno alle “comunità cinesi” in Italia, guardate allo stesso tempo con ammirazione e con sospetto per essere riuscite a contenere il contagio (emblematico è il titolo del Corriere della Sera “Coronavirus, le “armi magiche” di Pechino: perché i negozi cinesi hanno chiuso per primi”, del 12 marzo 2020)\(^3\). Tali rappresentazioni, tuttavia, riflettono distorsioni percettive tutt’altro che nuove nei confronti di cinesi e sinodiscendenti: come riportato da numerosi studiosi, e come già anticipato sopra, infatti, il discorso

---

\(^1\) Per avere maggiori informazioni sulle sessioni tematiche e sui principali temi trattati (ultima consultazione: giugno 2023), si veda il materiale al link [https://issco.site/conferences](https://issco.site/conferences).


mediatico dominante italiano è da molti anni intriso di stereotipi negativi e pregiudizi nei confronti di queste persone (cfr. Chu, 2019; Zhang, 2017, 2019; inter alia).


2. Lo studio condotto: il dataset e l’impianto metodologico

Lo scopo di questo contributo è quello di descrivere i principali passaggi di un’analisi qualitativa, condotta su un corpus di articoli giornalistici di quotidiani italiani di larga diffusione e di giornali e portali web per migranti cinesi in Italia, finalizzata a studiare l’impatto provocato dallo scoppio e dagli sviluppi della pandemia sulla vita sociale di cinesi e sinodiscendenti in varie parti del paese. Ulteriori obiettivi collaterali si focalizzano sull’analisi del discorso mediatico in relazione alle interrelazioni simboliche fra i cinesi in Italia e la loro madrepatria, sia per quanto riguarda il sostegno della Repubblica Popolare ai connazionali all’estero (in particolare sotto forma di aiuti forniti a questi ultimi e anche al sistema sanitario italiano) sia per ciò che concerne l’influenza esercitata da un discorso pubblico dominante in Cina, che pone in primo piano la retorica della “via cinese” della lotta al COVID come migliore modello di riferimento (Fumian, 2020).

2.1. Struttura e caratteristiche principali del dataset

Il corpus collezionato e analizzato è composto da un totale di 48 testi giornalistici, 24 dei quali provengono da quotidiani di larga diffusione in Italia e 24 da giornali/portali di informazioni rivolti a persone cinesi/sinodiscendenti in Italia. Per quanto riguarda le sue caratteristiche generali, si tratta di un corpus interamente scritto, sincronico, bilingue, comprensibile (per temi trattati nelle varie fonti, per numero di parole contenute nei due sotto-corpora) e per il percorso temporale di riferimento, e contrastivo, formato da testi interi di carattere giornalistico, che sono stati poi codificati secondo una prospettiva principalmente corpus-driven (Riccio 2016, p. 19; per dettagli sulla codifica rimandiamo al paragrafo 3). Si tratta inoltre di un corpus relativamente rappresentativo per l’obiettivo generale dell’analisi, ovvero quello di indagare sull’impatto della pandemia sulla vita sociale, individuale e sulle percezioni delle/sulle persone cinesi/sinodiscendenti residenti in Italia. Bisogna specificare, comunque, che l’analisi qui prosposta non ha pretesa di esaustività né di generalizzabilità delle conclusioni da essa derivate, anche se contribuisce a fornire interessanti spunti di riflessione sia per lo studio dei media sia per le implicazioni legate ai temi indagati.

Nello specifico, i testi in lingua italiana sono stati raccolti da La Repubblica (n = 6), La Stampa (n = 6), Il Corriere della Sera (n = 6) e La Nazione (n = 6), mentre quelli in lingua cinese fanno riferimento a Yidali shijie Zhongguo 意大利世界中国, noto al pubblico italofono anche come Cina in Italia (n = 8), Ouzhou lianhe shibao 欧洲联合时报, noto in italiano come Il tempo Europa-Cina (n = 8) e dal portale di notizie web Yidali xinwen wang 意大利新闻网 (n = 8). La tiratura dei quotidiani italiani sopra menzionati è nota, così come la loro diffusione a livello nazionale; per quanto riguarda i giornali/portali di informazione cinesi consultati, al momento della selezione tutti gli articoli raccolti erano stati consultati da alcune migliaia di lettori, in qualche caso anche più di 10.000, dimostrando quindi a loro volta una discreta circolazione. Tutte e tre le fonti in cinese, infatti, vantano una diffusione storica tra i migranti cinesi in Italia. Nello specifico, il primo dei tre rappresenta l’edizione italiana di China Newsweek, periodico edito da China News, che conta 40 milioni di visualizzazioni al giorno. Cina in Italia nacque nel 2001 come periodico multitematico in lingua cinese e si attestò rapidamente tra le fonti più consultate dai cinesi in Italia. Nel 2007 la rivista diventò bilingue e negli ultimi anni, attraverso la costruzione e l’aggiornamento continuo del suo sito web, permette una vasta diffusione delle notizie quotidiane fra cinesi, sinodiscendenti e non solo. Anche Il tempo Europa-Cina e Yidali xinwen wang rappresentano due punti di riferimento per l’accesso alle informazioni locali da parte di persone sinofone in Italia: il primo nacque in versione cartacea nel 1999, mentre il secondo venne inaugurato nel 2004 come portale di notizie riguardanti sia il contesto italiano sia quello cinese.
La lunghezza totale del sotto-corpus in lingua italiana ammonta a circa 12.300 parole, mentre quello in lingua cinese conta un totale di 19.100 caratteri. Si specifica che il cinese è una lingua che processa i contenuti testuali per numero di caratteri, non per numero di parole (il concetto di “parola” nella lingua cinese è una importazione recente, introdotta sostanzialmente con l’inizio del periodo “coloniale” a metà XIX secolo). Considerando comunque che nel cinese standard contemporaneo più del 70% delle parole sono bisillabiche (Abbiati, 2017), in questo caso è possibile fare una proporzione fra numero complessivo di parole del sotto-corpus italiano e numero complessivo di caratteri del sotto-corpus cinese per dedurre che le parole dei due sotto-corpora sono pressoché equivalenti numericamente. Al fine di verificare in modo più puntuale tale comparabilità numerica, si è ottenuto un ulteriore riscontro dell’equivalenza caratteri cinesi – parole italiane attraverso una traduzione in italiano dell’intero sotto-corpus cinese tramite il programma DeepL:4 da tale operazione deriva che il numero di parole italiane ottenute con la traduzione ammonta a 11.932, ovvero una mole estremamente vicina a quella del sotto-corpus italiano corrispondente.

Per quanto riguarda i criteri adottati per selezionare l’intero corpus in modo affidabile e per rendere comparabili i due sotto-corpora, specialmente in relazione agli obiettivi di analisi, si sono presi in considerazione i seguenti aspetti:

- **periodo temporale**: si è scelto concentrarsi su avvenimenti e questioni che vanno dallo scoppio dei primi casi di COVID in Italia fino a tutta la seconda ondata, quindi indicativamente dal mese di febbraio a dicembre 2020.
- **Aspetti della pandemia su cui è stato posto il focus.** I temi trattati sono equamente rappresentati in entrambi i sotto-corpora e, nello specifico, riguardano i seguenti ambiti: l’impatto del COVID sulle attività lavorative dei cinesi in Italia (n = 5 fonti nel sotto-corpus italiano e n = 5 fonti nel sotto-corpus cinese); la pervasività del virus e i comportamenti virtuosi in termini di auto-isolamento e di adozione a livello informale di misure preventive da parte dei cinesi in Italia (n = 5 fonti nel sotto-corpus italiano e n = 5 fonti nel sotto-corpus cinese); report periodici relativi alla pervasività del contagio in particolare in zone dove risiedono molte persone cinesi (n = 5 fonti nel sotto-corpus italiano e n = 5 fonti nel sotto-corpus cinese); le donazioni solidali da parte della Repubblica Popolare Cinese verso l’Italia e i cinesi d’oltremare e il ruolo attivo delle persone cinesi in Italia nella promozione e nella distribuzione di tali donazioni (n = 4 fonti nel sotto-corpus italiano e n = 4 fonti nel sotto-corpus cinese); il racconto di episodi di sinofobia e atteggiamenti di razzismo o violenza nei confronti di cinesi in Italia in concomitanza con lo scoppio della pandemia (n = 3 fonti nel sotto-corpus italiano e n = 3 fonti nel sotto-corpus cinese); le assenze da scuola dei bambini cinesi o sinodiscendenti e le implicazioni relative alla loro carriera scolastica e ai loro rapporti interpersonali (n = 2 fonti nel sotto-corpus italiano e n = 2 fonti nel sotto-corpus cinese).
- **Criterio della pluralità geografica.** Al fine di ottenere una fotografia il più possibile rappresentativa dell’impatto della pandemia sui cinesi in Italia, sono state selezionate notizie relative a diversi contesti geografici con una considerevole presenza storica di cittadini della Repubblica Popolare, ovvero Prato, Roma, Milano, Torino, Napoli e Padova, ma sono state prese in considerazione anche altre località urbane minori, principalmente localizzate in Piemonte, in Emilia-Romagna e in Toscana. La Tabella 1 riassume le informazioni più importanti inerenti al corpus raccolto.

---

4 DeepL è un software online che consente di svolgere traduzioni automatiche da una lingua di partenza a una lingua di arrivo, anche direttamente con caricamento di file Word o PDF, con un alto grado di affidabilità.
2.2. L’impianto metodologico alla base dello studio

Come citato nella sezione precedente, l’analisi condotta sul corpus raccolto riflette un approccio principalmente corpus-driven, poiché per buona parte dei processi di codifica è stato usato un metodo induttivo, elaborando ipotesi a partire direttamente dai dati.

Tuttavia, si ritiene opportuno precisare che quello utilizzato è un approccio misto, che mette in comunicazione paradigmi metodologici diversi e complementari, in parte basati anche su una prospettiva deduttiva. I costrutti teorico-metodologici di riferimento per tale approccio misto si rifanno alla Grounded Theory (Charmaz, 2006), alla Qualitative Content Analysis, da un punto di vista sia induttivo che deduttivo (Mayring, 2000), e per quanto riguarda in particolare i processi di labeling dei nodi concettuali codificati, al filone dei Chinese Discourse Studies (Shi-xu, 2014).

La Grounded Theory, ovvero la prospettiva che riflette in modo più consistente un approccio induttivo e corpus-driven, venne introdotta da Glaser e Strauss (1967) come “the discovery of theory from data—systematically obtained and analyzed in social research” (p. 1). Come sottolineato nei vari documenti elaborati dal Grounded Theory Institute, infatti, “Grounded Theory is an inductive methodology. Although many call Grounded Theory a qualitative method, it is not. It is a general method. It is the systematic generation of theory from systematic research. It is a set of rigorous research procedures leading to the emergence of conceptual categories. (...) Grounded Theory can be used with either qualitative or quantitative data”. (Grounded Theory Institute, 2013). La Grounded Theory si presenta quindi come un metodo di analisi che parte dai dati, grazie al quale la teoria stessa si costruisce, si negozia e si ridefinisce attraverso la codifica dei dati stessi. Inizialmente venne usata per analisi di tipo sociologico, ma successivamente ha raggiunto una vasta gamma di applicazioni, che vanno dalla psicologia all’antropologia, dall’educazione alla etnolinguistica (Bazeley & Jackson, 2013).

Negli ultimi anni, in particolare grazie a Charmaz (2006), si è affermata in seno alla Grounded Theory una corrente ispirata ad un approccio socio-interazionale, con la quale è stato messo in discussione il decentramento del ricercatore, enfatizzando invece un suo maggiore coinvolgimento, anche insieme ai partecipanti, nel caso di corpora basati su interviste, nella costruzione della teoria. Questa versione “moderata” della Grounded Theory, che presuppone l’inclusione di un margine di soggettività del ricercatore nell’analisi, è quella presa in considerazione nel presente studio.
Per fornire un esempio di applicazione del paradigma della Grounded Theory al processo di codifica, i due nodi nominati “Resilienza dei cinesi in Italia” e “Strategie per ripensare attività lavorative cinesi in Italia” (entrambi afferenti al tree node “Pandemia e impatto sulla vita sociale”, come vedremo nel prossimo Par.) emergono in modo implicito dall’analisi stessa, senza alcuna ipotesi formulata a priori da parte del ricercatore in relazione a questi due aspetti.

L’altro pilastro su cui poggia l’impianto metodologico del presente studio è rappresentato dalla Qualitative Content Analysis (QCA), uno strumento usato principalmente per analizzare “the content of media text to enable similar results to be established across a group of text coders” (Priest, Roberts, & Woods, 2002, p. 35). Differenemente dalla Grounded Theory, dalla QCA emerge una dimensione maggiormente soggettiva nell’interpretazione dei dati, che deriva dalla suddivisione di questo approccio in una dimensione induttiva e in una dimensione deduttiva, cui si può far riferimento in modo integrato ed organico. Secondo un’accezione generale, infatti, la QCA viene definita “a research method for subjective interpretation of the content of text data through the systematic classification process of coding and identifying themes or patterns” (Hsieh & Shannon, 2005, p. 1278).

In seno alla QCA si predilige una prospettiva induttiva quando la conoscenza pregressa relativa al fenomeno studiato è limitata o frammentaria (Elo & Kyngäs, 2008), mentre si adotta una prospettiva deduttiva quando l’obiettivo dell’analisi è quello di validare/confirmare un approccio teorico già esistente, oppure quello di manipolare in un una nuova cornice contestuale dati precedentemente raccolti (Cho & Lee, 2014).

Per fornire un esempio di codifica secondo la QCA, il nodo denominato “Sinofobia e diffidenza da attività cinesi” (v. Par. 3) riflette un approccio deduttivo, poiché convalida una ipotesi già presente ancor prima di condurre l’analisi.

L’ultima delle tre prospettive teorico-metodologiche che compongono l’approccio misto di cui ci si è avvalse per condurre l’analisi è quella dei Chinese Discourse Studies (Shi-xu, 2014), un promotente filone di studi emerso nell’ambito dei più vasti Cultural Discourse Studies (ivi), il cui obiettivo principale è quello di assimilare una prospettiva interpretativa il più possibile decentrata rispetto ai criteri etnocentrici e anglocentrici che dominano e guidano la maggior parte dei lavori di discourse analysis, sia nel Global North che nel Global South, come riflesso di dinamiche neo-coloniali di condizionamento della conoscenza. Come sottolinea Shi-xu (2014), infatti, “mainstream discourse analysis, as well as communication studies, is basically Western and in many respects Westcentric (...) Cultural Discourse Studies have yielded deeper, novel and practicable insights into culture-specific realities on the one hand and broadened and enriched international scholarly understanding on the other (p. 21)”. Nello specifico, i Chinese Discourse Studies sfidano l’anglocentrismo da un’altra prospettiva, quella della cosiddetta Sinosfera, con i suoi universi simbolici e semiotici di riferimento. Attraverso tale paradigma si rivendica la necessità di condurre discourse studies riguardanti il mondo cinese evitando di replicare schemi interpretativi di stampo anglosassone o occidentalista, e allo stesso tempo di fare uso di categorie di analisi più aderenti a impianti concettuali vicini alla tradizione cinese. Con le parole di Shi-xu (2014), infatti, “a culturally more concrete and particular paradigm of discourse studies directed at contemporary Chinese culture and society, vis-à-vis the rampant Westcentric, neo-colonialist ways of understanding China as well as blind application and reproduction of such knowledge (pp. 193-4)”. I Chinese Discourse Studies vengono quindi intesi in questa sede come uno strumento efficace in particolare nel processo di labeling dei nodi codificati, per rifuggire dalla tentazione di cadere nell’essenzalismo culturale e da meccanismi di orientalizzazione (Dervin & Machart, 2013).

Due esempi rappresentativi di labeling secondo la prospettiva dei Chinese Discourse Studies sono dati dai nodi “Elogio della/orgoglio per la Zhongguo wenming 中国文明 ("civiltà/civilizzazione cinese", concetto con connotazioni specifiche e intriso di determinati aspetti simbolici in relazione al discorso politico mainstream, in particolare nell’era di Xi Jinping, n.d.a.” e “Richiamo a responsabilità huaren 华人” (laddove per rivolgersi ai migranti si usa la parola huaren, che sottende l’idea di “cittadino cinese a tutti gli effetti”, con la carica simbolico-affettiva che ne segue, in contrapposizione al termine più diffuso per connotare in modo neutro i cinesi d’oltremare, ovvero huqiao 华侨, "migrante cinese").

Lo strumento che ha permesso di svolgere il processo di analizzare dell’intero corpus è il software per l’analisi testuale NVivo 11 (Bazeley & Jackson, 2013; Leech & Onwuegbuzie, 2011), ovvero un programma multifunzionale con il quale è possibile codificare il corpus attraverso la costruzione di nodi concettuali gerarchici (tree nodes con i relativi child nodes) fino ad uno stato di apparente saturazione, secondo la prospettiva del researcher-denoted coding (Baralt, 2011; Hadley, 2017): tale prospettiva presuppone un ruolo preminente del ricercatore nella costruzione delle gerarchie di nodi, che vengono ricavate dal costrutto teorico.
che emerge durante l’analisi stessa, come riflesso dell’applicazione di metodologie di stampo induttivo, come quella che si rifà alla Grounded Theory (Charmaz, 2006). Inoltre, secondo tale paradigma, il processo di codifica non procede in modo lineare ma in modo circolare, poiché per monitorare le interrelazioni tra i nodi e la corenza interna di ognuno di essi è necessario svolgere revisioni costanti, che consentono di eliminare e uniformare nodi superflui (perché riscontrati in un numero troppo esiguo di testi o di riferimenti nei testi), o concettualmente troppo simili a nodi già esistenti. La codifica finale rispecchia quindi una serie di criteri di coerenza dettati dalla ricorrenza e dalla consistenza dei nodi codificati e gerarchizzati; anche la costruzione di tree nodes è rappresentativa della visione che porta il ricercatore a ricondurre sotto un medesimo “ombrello concettuale” nodi che trattano questioni più o meno specifiche, ma affini tematicamente. Per controllare ogni singolo step dell’analisi, con l’obiettivo di garantire un grado di accuratezza e affidabilità nel monitoraggio delle codifiche, è stato usato un’apposito coding journal, corredato da memos e appunti inseriti in concomitanza di passaggi specifici nelle varie fonti o nei vari testi, attraverso i quali sono stati annotati i diversi passaggi intercorsi.

Sulla base dell’analisi svolta secondo i criteri esposti sopra, quindi, sono stati quindi codificati 62 nodi diversi, riuniti in quattro tree nodes che mettono a fuoco le macro-tematiche oggetto dell’analisi e che verranno illustrati nel prossimo paragrafo. Tutti i testi sono stati quindi analizzati più volte, con livelli di coding density che spesso dimostrano la possibilità di codificare più nodi in concomitanza di una medesima espressione o di un medesimo paragrafo (si veda la Figura 1 come esempio di coding density di un testo in cinese del quotidiano Yidali shijie Zhongguo, o “Cina in Italia”).

![Figura 1](image)

**Figura 1. Esempio di coding density di un testo di un articolo tratto da Yidali shijie Zhongguo, o “Cina in Italia”**

Come verrà mostrato nei paragrafi seguenti, oltre ad aver condotto una codifica di tutti i testi raccolti, il corpus è stato interrogato attraverso queries di varia tipologia, in particolare attraverso il matrix coding, tecnica che ha permesso di comparare più fonti (o più gruppi di fonti) in base a particolari parametri (come ad esempio la ricorrenza e il numero di riferimenti a determinati nodi), o attraverso la text frequency.
3. Analisi dei dati

L’analisi condotta sul corpus raccolto, svolta secondo i criteri menzionati nel paragrafo 2, ha consentito di codificare un totale di 62 nodi, radunati in quattro tree nodes principali, denominati “Attitudini nei confronti degli huaqiao 华侨 (‘migranti cinesi’, n.d.a.)”, “Dinamiche di visibilità, prestigio e legame con la madrepatria”, “Gestione e sviluppi della pandemia” e “Pandemia e impatto sulla vita sociale”, e che riflettono appunto i macrotemi ai quali è stata dedicata maggiore attenzione. Il totale di references, ovvero porzioni più o meno lunghe di testo codificate in relazione ai 62 nodi, ammonta a 1.252: si specifica che, come è ben visibile dalla coding density del testo in lingua cinese riportato nella Figura 1, molto spesso è stato possibile codificare una stessa reference anche con due o più nodi (lo stesso titolo dell’articolo della Figura 1 è stato codificato con tre nodi diversi, i quali rappresentano il risultato di tre angolature interpretative diverse dell’estratto).

Il tree node “Attitudini nei confronti degli huaqiao 华侨” (Figura 2) si compone di un totale di 15 child nodes disposti in due livelli gerarchici, per un totale di 388 references: i child nodes “Percezioni e distorsioni”, “Sinofilia” e “Sinofobia” sono infatti child nodes di primo livello e a loro volta generano ulteriori sotto-nodi più specifici e coerenti con le tematiche cui essi si riferiscono. Il child node “Riferimenti ad atteggiamenti di condanna comportamenti di cinesi in Italia”, invece, viene definito free node, poiché non genera ulteriori sotto-nodi da esso dipendenti. Il focus principale di questo macro-nodo ruota intorno alle attitudini, sia negative che positive, alle percezioni e alle distorsioni rappresentative nei confronti dei cinesi residenti in Italia durante il periodo analizzato. Particolarmente numerosi sono gli episodi di sinofobia, talvolta sfociati in atteggiamenti di palese razzismo e/o di violenza fisica e verbale, riportati in special modo nel sotto-corpus italiano; rispetto a questi ultimi, invece, sono numericamente minori, anche se sempre piuttosto consistenti, i riferimenti che rispecchiano un atteggiamento di sinofilia e di elogio di comportamenti virtuosi dei cinesi in Italia. Il nodo “Percezioni e distorsioni”, invece, fa principalmente riferimento a ipergeneralizzazioni e rappresentazioni stereotipate dei cinesi in Italia, o direttamente da parte di giornalisti italiani (che molto spesso, ad esempio, insistono su una retorica intrisa di pregiudizi della “comunità cinese chiusa”, da cui deriva una percezione di continuo e ingiustificato sospetto e mistero), oppure da parte della popolazione locale.

Il tree node “Dinamiche di visibilità, prestigio e legame con la madrepatria” (Figura 3) raccoglie un totale di 12 altri nodi, con tre child nodes di primo livello (“Reticina della lotta al COVID”, “Riconoscenza verso la Cina” e “Sistemi valoriali legati alla Sinosfera”) che generano ulteriori sotto-nodi e due free nodes (“Legame con la madrepatria” e “Riferimento a collegamenti aerei con la Cina”), per un totale di 135 references. In questo macro-nodo l’attenzione viene principalmente rivolta alle interazioni simboliche fra huaqiao e madrepatria, nonché all’impatto esercitato dalla Repubblica Popolare Cinese su cinesi e sinodiscendenti all’estero, in termini di creazione e diffusione di un modello vincente di lotta al COVID, cui vengono connessi “sistemi valoriali” legati alla Sinosfera (e in particolare alla retorica e al discorso politico dell’era di Xi Jinping, cfr. Fumian, 2020). Vengono altresì inclusi in questo tree node riferimenti ad episodi di elogio dell’altruismo cinese e di riconoscenza da parte delle istituzioni italiane nei confronti degli aiuti provenienti dalla Repubblica Popolare.
Il tree node “Gestione e sviluppi della pandemia” (Figura 4) è composto da 19 ulteriori nodi, tre dei quali sono child nodes di primo livello (“Andamento contagi”, “Gestione pandemia” e “Percezioni legate a gestione pandemia”), che generano tutti ulteriori sotto-nodi più specifici, per un totale di 338 references. Il principale focus qui è sulle traiettorie tracciate dagli sviluppi della pandemia, sia da un punto di vista di gestione politica a livello top-down sia per quanto riguarda alcune diffuse percezioni legate allo scoppio e ai protrarsi dei contagi. In particolare, nel nodo “Andamento contagi” ci si riferisce alle variazioni nel numero di contagiati in Italia, in Cina e fra i cinesi in Italia, nonché alla pervasività del virus durante le principali ondate; il nodo “Gestione pandemia” fa principalmente riferimento ad una dimensione politica, a livello transnazionale, nazionale e locale, cui spesso si accosta una comparazione tra la condotta istituzionale virtuosa da parte della Repubblica Popolare nella gestione dei contagi entro i propri confini e nella solidarietà con le altre aree del mondo colpite dal virus; il nodo “Percezioni legate a gestione pandemia”, invece, va ad indagare sulla dimensione percettiva, da parte di cinesi e sinodiscendenti in Italia, e da parte del resto dell’opinione pubblica italiana, nei confronti della gestione istituzionale della pandemia.
Figura 4. Articolazione interna del tree node “Gestione e sviluppi della pandemia”
Il tree node “Pandemia e impatto sulla vita sociale” (Figura 5), infine, raccoglie 13 ulteriori child nodes e il maggior numero di references codificate, ovvero 391. Nello specifico, questo macro-nodo ha 5 sotto-nodi di primo livello, tre dei quali danno origine ad ulteriori child nodes (“Impatto emotivo e psicologico”, “Mondo del lavoro”, “Scuola e istruzione”) e due dei quali sono free nodes (“Impatto pandemia su vita sociale” e “Resilienza dei cinesi in Italia”). Il focus principale di questo tree node è sui vari aspetti della vita sociale, emotiva e psicologica sui quali è stato esercitato un particolare impatto dalla pandemia da COVID. Innanzitutto, si fa particolare riferimento ad una dimensione individuale da una prospettiva emotiva e psicologica (in modo specifico per quanto concerne sia la continua e ripetuta paura del contagio, sia una visibile propensione alla solidarietà verso i connazionali e verso la società locale) e anche da una prospettiva di interazione degli individui all’interno dei macro-contesti sociali. Si dedica altresì particolare attenzione all’impatto, spesso negativo, esercitato dal virus sia sulle attività lavorative di cinesi e sinodiscendenti in Italia e sulla frequenza scolastica dei figli, ma anche alla capacità di resistere alle difficoltà attraverso il mutuo soccorso e la ricerca di specifiche vie per rispondere in modo proattivo all’emergenza epocale causata dalla pandemia.

4. Risultati preliminari e implicazioni

Alla luce di quanto illustrato precedentemente in merito alle fasi di articolazione dell’analisi, in questo paragrafo verranno mostrati e discussi alcuni tra i risultati principali ottenuti attraverso specifiche indagini condotte sul corpus. Innanzitutto, nella Tabella 2 vengono riportati i nodi che sono stati rintracciati nella maggior parte di fonti e che riportano i numeri più alti di references. Per ogni nodo viene riportata una reference di esempio dal sotto-corpus di lingua italiana e una dal sotto-corpus in lingua cinese (con l’aggiunta di una traduzione letterale in italiano). Il nodo codificato nel maggior numero di articoli (21) e rintracciato nel maggior numero di references (87) è quello denominato “Paura del contagio”, e fa particolare riferimento alla sensazione di timore di contrarre il virus, legata a specifiche circostanze o prolungata nel tempo, da parte di persone cinesi in Italia. Tale nodo emerge in modo bilanciato in entrambi i sotto-corpora e dimostra quanto sia stato pervasivo questo stato d’animo fin dallo scoppio dei primi casi di COVID in Italia. Il secondo nodo più codificato (19 fonti e 56 references) è quello denominato “Sinofilia ed elogio comportamenti virtuosi cinesi in Italia” e riassume una serie di considerazioni positive espresse sia dall’opinione pubblica italiana nei confronti della grande responsabilità di cinesi/sinodiscendenti nella prevenzione dal virus, sia da parte di cinesi/residenti in Italia nei confronti della ricezione positiva di indicazioni provenienti dalla madrepatria sulle buone pratiche per contenere il contagio. Anche questo nodo è stato codificato in modo abbastanza equo in entrambi i sotto-corpora, anche se emerge in modo più evidente nei testi in lingua cinese. Al terzo posto troviamo “Impatto pandemia sulla vita sociale” (18 fonti, 52 references), che mostra quanto siano state fortì le conseguenze (in genere negative) della pandemia sulla vita sociale delle persone cinesi/sinodiscendenti in Italia. Tale impatto
spesso si misura anche in relazione alla paura della pervasività del contagio e alla sua capacità di compromettere i rapporti sociali, lavorativi e addirittura la fiducia in istituzioni locali come le scuole dei figli (come dimostra appunto il nodo "Pandemia e assenze da scuola", codificato in 9 fonti e 44 references). Un nodo fortemente codificato, peraltro soltanto nel sotto-corpus di giornali italiani, è quello denominato "Reterica delle comunità" (17 fonti, 48 references): esso mette in luce un atteggiamento intriso di pre-comprensioni e stereotipi da parte dei giornalisti italiani, secondo molti dei quali esistono “comunità cinesi” coesiste, che si comportano in modo univoco e che spesso sono "chiuse” e “misteriose”. Tale approccio, molto diffuso nel discorso mediatico relativo ai cinesi in Italia, purtroppo spesso rischia di alimentare (più o meno implicitamente) rappresentazioni sociali distorte nell’opinione pubblica nei confronti di queste persone. Un ultimo nodo che ha ricevuto molte codifiche (10 fonti, 45 references), in particolare nel sotto-corpus italiano, è quello chiamato “Episodi di sinofobia”, con il quale emergono narrazioni di episodi di violenza verbale o fisica nei confronti di cinesi/sinodiscendenti, poiché sospettati di essere portatori e diffusori del virus in Italia: un tema emerso drammaticamente anche in altri contesti globali, come negli Stati Uniti, come anticipato nel Par. 1.

Tabella 2

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Nome nodi</th>
<th>Numero fonti</th>
<th>Numero codifiche</th>
<th>Esempio in italiano</th>
<th>Esempio in cinese</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Paura del contagio</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>87</td>
<td>Coronavirus, la Chinatown spettrale di Prato. &quot;Qui tutti in casa abbiamo paura&quot;.</td>
<td>“我们华人都会尽可能地避免外出，但其他人却好像什么事都没发生一样，照常出行，这让我们感到非常害怕”。(ITA: “Noi cinesi cerchiamo di evitare di uscire, ma altre persone si comportano come se nulla fosse, escono come di solito, e questo ci mette molta paura”).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sinofilia ed elogio comportamenti virtuosi cinesi in Italia</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>Smentita l’ipotesi che i cinesi di Prato da settimane abbiano iniziato una fuga verso la madrepatria per fare ricorso a un vaccino sperimentale, l’unica spiegazione al fenomeno dell’immunità è quella del lockdown applicato alla perfezione.</td>
<td>市长说：”在中国新年过后，大量的华人从中国返回普拉托，但是他们严格遵守了隔离规定，他们自我隔离，留在家中。（ITA: “Il sindaco ha detto: ‘Dopo aver trascorso il capodanno in Cina, molte persone cinesi sono tornate a Prato, ma hanno osservato in modo severo le regole di isolamento. Si sono messe in autoisolamento e sono rimaste a casa’”).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Impatto pandemia su vita sociale</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>Coronavirus, la Chinatown spettrale di Prato. &quot;Qui tutti in casa abbiamo paura&quot;.</td>
<td>疫情暴发，不少国家关闭学校，开启网课模式，而一些地区仍在线下授课。无论哪种模式，对海外华人家长来说，都是一个不小的挑战。（ITA: “Con lo scoppio della pandemia molti paesi hanno chiuso le scuole e hanno iniziato a fare didattica online, ma in alcune zone si continua a insegnare offline. Indipendentemente dal modello (didattico), secondo i genitori cinesi all’estero ciò rappresenta una grande sfida”).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Retorica delle comunità</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>La preoccupazione maggiore era che tra le comunità cinesi all’estero e le comunità locali si creassero conflitti, scoppiasero tensioni.</td>
<td>///</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Episodi di sinofobia 10 45 Psicosi coronavirus, cinese aggredita a Torino: “Hai il virus, vai via o ti ammazzo”.

Pandemia e assenze da scuola 9 44 Oltre il 90 per cento delle famiglie cinesi residenti in Italia hanno paura di mandare i loro figli a scuola e li terranno a casa.

Fra le analisi svolte, si ritiene opportuno riportare alcuni risultati derivanti da matrix coding queries ottenute incrociando la frequenza di codifiche di specifici nodi in relazione a giornali diversi oppure in relazione ai due sotto-corpora. La prima matrix coding query qui presentata (Tabella 3) è quella che si riferisce al confronto relativo al numero di codifiche dei nodi che fanno capo al tree node “Sinofobia” (a sua volta child node del macro-node “Attitudini nei confronti degli huaqiao 华侨”). Tali nodi riguardano diversi aspetti legati alla sinofobia, che vanno dalla semplice narrazione di atteggiamenti razzisti o di violenza alla condanna aperta verso di essi. Dalla query emerge che, mentre gli articoli de La Stampa in particolare, ma anche de La Repubblica e del Corriere della Sera, dedicano attenzione alla narrazione di questi aspetti, negli articoli de La Nazione sono scarsi o addirittura assenti i riferimenti ad episodi di sinofobia, nonché alla condanna nei confronti di tali atteggiamenti.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Giornale</th>
<th>Condanna episodi sinofobia</th>
<th>Episodi sinofobia</th>
<th>Minimizzazione episodi sinofobia</th>
<th>Racconto atteggiamenti razzisti o violenza</th>
<th>Sinofobia e diffidenza da attività cinesi</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Corriere</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nazione</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Repubblica</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>La Stampa</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Un’altra matrix coding query condotta (Tabella 4) riguarda le codifiche relative alle varie articolazioni del tree node “Percezioni e distorsioni” (dentro il macro-node “Attitudini nei confronti degli huaqiao 华侨”), sempre nei vari quotidiani italiani. In questo caso l’attenzione è rivolta in particolare al linguaggio utilizzato dai diversi giornali, più o meno intriso di generalizzazioni e di elementi di “razzismo democratico” (uno stile discorsivo che, di solito in modo involontario, può richiamare o produrre atteggiamenti di velato razzismo, cfr. Faso, 2008), di pregiudizi e falsi miti nei confronti di cinesi/sinodiscendenti in Italia, nonché di retoriche del “mistero” e delle “comunità coese e chiuse” citate precedentemente. Ancora una volta il primato di codifiche spetta agli articoli de La Nazione, che tendono quindi a caratterizzarsi come testi più intrisi di visioni stereotipate e di rappresentazioni distorte dei cinesi; decisamente più equilibrati in questo senso sembrano invece essere gli articoli de La Repubblica e La Stampa, anche se la rappresentazione iper-semplicificata della/e “comunità cinese/i” sembra essere un tratto trasversale alle varie testate.
Una terza matrix coding query, i cui risultati sono mostrati nella Tabella 5, riguarda invece il confronto relativo al numero di codifiche del nodo “Sinofilia ed elogio comportamenti virtuosi cinesi in Italia” (anch’esso interno al macro-nodo “Attitudini nei confronti degli huajiao 华侨”), sempre in relazione ai quattro quotidiani italiani qui presi in considerazione. Dalla query emerge che La Nazione, il giornale che è meno incline a raccontare e condannare episodi di sinofobia, paradossalmente è quello in cui trovano maggiore spazio riferimenti legati a comportamenti responsabili e virtuosi delle persone cinesi in Italia, nell’adozione su iniziativa personale di strategie di prevenzione dal contagio al momento dello scoppio della pandemia, nel mantenimento di bassi livelli di infezioni fra connazionali e nelle molteplici iniziative di solidarietà anche verso la società italiana (diversi sono infatti i riferimenti alle donazioni volontarie di dispositivi di protezione).

Tabella 5
Matrix coding query condotta sul nodo “sinofilia ed elogio comportamenti virtuosi cinesi in Italia”

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Giornale</th>
<th>Occorrenze</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Corriere</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nazione</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Repubblica</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>La Stampa</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

I risultati delle ultime due matrix coding queries qui riportati riguardano comparazioni tra i due interi sotto-corpora. La prima delle due (Tabella 6) ha come focus l’analisi della numerosità di codifiche relative ad alcuni child nodes dei macro-nodi “Dinamiche di visibilità, prestigio e legame con la madrepatria” e “Gestione e sviluppi della pandemia”. L’obiettivo è quello di misurare la consistenza con cui emergono nei due sotto-corpora elementi retorici tipicamente legati ad un discorso mediatico e politico teso ad avvalorare, da un lato, il modello cinese di lotta al virus come modello vincente, e dall’altro lato ad richiamarsi a meccanismi discorsivi che rimandano all’idea della guerra ad un nemico comune, il COVID appunto. Come si evince dalla Tabella 6, per tutti i nodi analizzati si riscontra un forte squilibrio nel numero delle codifiche a favore dei giornali/portali di informazione in lingua cinese, che tendono molto spesso ad impostare il discorso sulla prevenzione del virus in termini di “guerra ad un nemico comune”. In questa guerra la Cina, con le sue politiche restrittive di contenimento del contagio, associate ad un “universo valoriale” che si richiama principalmente al concetto cinese di wenming 文明 (“civiltà”, si veda la sezione 2.2.), viene rappresentata come il migliore modello possibile di lotta.
Tabella 6
Matrix coding query condotta su alcuni nodi dipendenti dai macro-nodi “dinamiche di visibilità, prestigio e legame con la madrepatria” e “gestione e sviluppi della pandemia”

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Giornali</th>
<th>Retorica del virus nemico comune</th>
<th>Retorica della guerra contro il COVID</th>
<th>Elogio della -orgoglio per la 中国文明</th>
<th>Richiamo a responsabilità 华人</th>
<th>Presunta superiorità Cina gestione della pandemia</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>italiani</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>cinesi</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

L’ultima delle matrix coding queries qui presentate (Tabella 7) incrocia il numero di codifiche relative ad alcuni specifici child nodes appartenenti ai macro-nodi “Attitudini nei confronti degli huaqiao 华侨” e “Gestione e sviluppi della pandemia”, comparando nuovamente i testi in italiano con quelli in cinese. In questo caso si va a indagare quanto siano pervasivi i discorsi sugli episodi di sinofobia (e la loro condanna) e quelli sulla sinofilia, sia relativamente all’elogo di comportamenti virtuosi di cinesi in Italia sia per quanto riguarda gli aiuti solidali offerti alla popolazione italiana da questi ultimi o direttamente dalla Repubblica Popolare. Se nel sotto-corpus in lingua italiana abbondano i riferimenti ad episodi di sinofobia (n = 40) avvenuti nei confronti di cinesi/sinodiscenti in Italia in particolare allo scoppi della pandemia, questo aspetto tende a passare in secondo piano nel sotto-corpus in lingua cinese (n = 6). In quest’ultimo, invece, maggiore attenzione viene dedicata alle questioni degli aiuti solidali della Cina e dei cinesi all’Italia o ai connazionali, o dell’elogo di comportamenti responsabili adottati da molti cinesi in Italia per contenere il contagio. Ciò potrebbe essere paradossalmente legato alla volontà, da parte cinese, di preservare la cosiddetta mianzi 面子 (“faccia”, intesa appunto in modo analogo all’accezione goffmaniana di “immagine sociale”, cfr. Pan, 2000) nella cornice di questa emergenza epocale, prediligendo rappresentazioni che rafforzano il prestigio della Cina e dei cinesi e tendendo a minimizzare la portata simbolica di episodi negativi ascrivibili ad un sentimento anti-cinese. Il concetto di mianzi, in particolare, è molto importante nella cultura dominante cinese, sia a livello interpersonale sia a livello istituzionale: definirlo unicamente come un gioco di equilibrio tra dinamiche di contegno e deferenza (Goffman, 1956) appare limitante, poiché esso ha una relazione molto forte con un sistema di pensiero, quello confuciano, che ha condizionato la vita sociale dei cinesi per più di duemila anni e che ancora riesce a giocare una forte influenza anche nel mondo della politica e delle relazioni internazionali della Repubblica Popolare (Scarpini, 2015). Preservare la mianzi, quindi, diventa fondamentale per il singolo perché contribuisce a mantenere un’immagine sociale positiva e rassicurante, e per l’intero Paese perché concorre a trasmettere un’idea di società “armoniosa” (per riprendere un termine caro sia all’ex presidente Hu Jintao sia all’attuale Xi Jinping).

Tabella 7
Matrix coding query condotta su specifici nodi dei tre node “attitudini nei confronti degli 华侨” e “gestione e sviluppi della pandemia”

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Giornali</th>
<th>Condanna episodi di sinofobia</th>
<th>Episodi di sinofobia</th>
<th>Aiuti solidali della Cina e dei cinesi all'Italia o ai connazionali</th>
<th>Organizzazione o contributo aiuti da parte di huaqiao 华侨</th>
<th>Sinofilia ed elogio comportamenti virtuosi cinesi in Italia</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>italiani</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>cinesi</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

5. Possibili applicazioni didattiche del presente studio

Alla luce dell’analisi esposta e dei risultati discussi sopra, appare utile soffermarsi sulle varie possibili applicazioni didattico-pedagogiche che possono scaturire dal presente studio. Si reputa infatti interessante ipotizzare attività didattiche, con vari gradi di complessità e con vari livelli di articolazione interna, sia per apprendenti sinofoni di italiano sia per apprendenti italofoni di cinese.

Infatti, lavorando sulla testualità, e in particolare sul genere del testo giornalistico, si possono innanzitutto stabilire punti di connessione e di differenza tra il modo di costruire e articolare un discorso scritto in italiano e in cinese; si possono altresì verificare analogie e diversità nell’uso di determinati stili (come il
cosiddetto *stile spezzato*, che sempre più caratterizza i testi di molti articoli giornalistici italiani e che impone usi interpuntivi e meccanismi di coerenza e coesione testuali molto particolari, cfr. Palermo, 2013). A partire da tali possibili piani di comparazione, rimanendo su una prospettiva di analisi dell’intero testo, si possono sollecitare gli apprendenti a fare inferenze sui diversi meccanismi logico-concettuali (livello della coerenza) e di architettura del testo (livello della coesione) che governano gli articoli di giornale in italiano e in cinese. In relazione ai testi analizzati è poi possibile lavorare su vari livelli: quello interfrasale, andando per esempio a intercettare la frequenza di determinati connettori interfrasali in italiano oppure la tendenza alla giustapposizione di frasi in cinese, la quale implica un conseguente carico interpretativo per il lettore, che deve infondere i legami logico-semanticamente tra la frase principale e le coordinate o le subordinate (Banfi, 2003); a livello frasale, per intercettare i punti di maggiore densità informativa all’interno di una frase, differenziando le frasi in termini di marcatezza sia a livello sintattico sia a livello pragmatico (verificando, ad esempio, quanto spesso compare la struttura tema-commento nei testi cinesi, cfr. Arcodia & Basciano, 2016); a livello lessicale, al fine di consolidare determinati campi lessicali relativi a temi di particolare attualità (come appunto, in questo caso, quello relativo alla diffusione endemica del COVID-19).

Tali attività possono essere svolte in momenti diversi dell’unità didattica, a seconda degli obiettivi e delle operazioni cognitive che il docente intende sollecitare negli apprendenti: ci si può avvalere quindi di tecniche didattiche diverse, con cui si possono organizzare attività di motivazione/avvicinamento al testo/ai testi, analisi, sintesi, riflessione ed eventualmente verifica (per uno sguardo d’insieme sulle varie tipologie di tecniche didattiche, sia in relazione alle varie fasi delle unità didattiche sia in relazione alle diverse possibili articolazioni di unità didattiche/unità di lavoro/unità di apprendimento, si rimanda a Danesi, Diadori, & Semplici, 2018).

La comparazione di testi giornalistici in italiano e in cinese, infine, può essere utile anche a lavorare in profondità su abilità e competenze nel campo della traduzione testuale, sia da un punto di vista linguistico sia da un punto di vista legato alla trasposizione nella lingua di arrivo di contenuti di carattere socio-culturale o legati a specifici discorsi politici o settoriali (Shei & Gao, 2018).

### 6. Considerazioni conclusive


Notevoli differenze si riscontrano altresì nella lettura più o meno stereotipata e/o intrisa di pregiudizi degli effetti della pandemia sui cinesi d’oltremare da parte dei vari quotidiani italiani. Si prende come esempio il numero di codicifiche per i nodi “Percezioni e falsi miti nei confronti dei cinesi” e “Retorica del mistero” (v. Tabella 4), che danno un’idea dei diversi approcci dei giornalisti delle diverse testate nei confronti della presenza di cinesi/sinodiscendenti in Italia. Allo stesso tempo, tuttavia, è interessante osservare che il quotidiano italiano maggiormente interessato da riferimenti che riportano atteggiamenti inclini agli stereotipi e alle generalizzazioni (o addirittura a fenomeni di “razzismo democratico”) da parte dei giornalisti, ovvero La
Oscillando tra sinonobia e sinofilia: un’analisi del discorso mediatico

Nazione, oscilla anche verso l’enfatizzazione dell’elogio di comportamenti virtuosi dei cinesi. Si tratta quindi di un approccio che tende a polarizzare le attitudini verso i cinesi in Italia, alternando visioni potenzialmente negative a visioni edulcorate, come se fosse sottesa l’idea di rispecchiare quella doppia faccia dell’essenzialismo culturale in chiave orientalista (Said, 1978; Squarcini, 2006), che nell’ “Oriente” intercetta appunto allo stesso tempo una fonte di fascinazione e un luogo simbolico per affermare una pretesa di superiorità dell’ “Occidente”.

Infine, per quanto riguarda il sotto-corpus cinese, si rintraccia in modo ben visibile un fortissimo legame con la madre patria e con una onnipresente retorica del “modello cinese” come unico modello possibile ed efficace di lotta al COVID. Si tratta di un’aderenza ai dettami del Partito che trova una motivazione anche in virtù del fatto che questi giornali o portali web ricevono finanziamenti dalla Repubblica Popolare, e che pertanto sono chiamati ad allinearsi il più possibile con un discorso politico sempre più pressante e propagandistico.

Considerando che in proprio nell’affermazione appena riportata sopra si può inevitabilmente rintracciare un bias della ricerca, si reputa opportuno mettere in evidenza anche i limiti che questo studio presenta. Innanzitutto, come già sottolineato nella sezione 2.1., poiché il corpus raccolto ammonta ad un numero ristretto di testi, le implicazioni tratte dall’analisi qui proposta non possono avere pretese di esaurivitività né di generalizzabilità. Tuttavia, auspicando di poter ampliare il corpus raggiungendo un numero di testi maggiormente rappresentativo, si ritiene che le conclusioni dello studio contribuiscano comunque a fornire interessanti spunti di riflessione, sia per lo studio dei media dei e sui cinesi in Italia, sia per le implicazioni legate alle principali tematiche oggetto di indagine. Un ulteriore limite è rappresentato dai diversi stilhi retorici con i quali vengono redatti i testi giornalistici nel contesto italiano e in quello cinese/sinofono: se è vero che nel modo di argomentare in cinese spesso si sottendono significati e concetti in modo implicito, è altrettanto vero che in tal caso il processo di codifica diventa più complesso e rischia inevitabilmente di trascurare riferimenti e nodi concettuali che possono essere soltanto intuiti “tra le righe” del testo.

In conclusione, come sottolineato nel paragrafo 5, si reputa interessante l’uso che si può fare del corpus raccolto anche in chiave didattico-pedagogica. Comparare articoli in italiano e in cinesi su temi analoga come quelli qui illustrati, può aiutare a stabilire analogie e differenze nell’organizzazione logico-concettuale (coerenza) e nell’architettura (coesione) di un testo giornalistico nelle due lingue, a costruire una serie di reti terminologiche bilingue italo-cinese (in questo caso, ad esempio, in relazione al COVID e al suo impatto sulla società) e a preparare il terreno per tradurre un testo da una lingua all’altra, osservandone le possibili variazioni inerenti all’organizzazione del discorso, ai meccanismi di visibilità e di ripresa di un tema, nonché agli elementi funzionali alla deissi personale, spaziale e temporale.

Riferimenti bibliografici


Andrea Scibetta, Università per Stranieri di Siena
scibetta@unistrasi.it

IT Andrea Scibetta è ricercatore di lingua e letteratura cinese presso l'Università per Stranieri di Siena, dove ha conseguito un Dottorato di Ricerca nel 2017 in Linguistica e Didattica della Lingua Italiana a Stranieri con una tesi sullo sviluppo delle competenze pragmatiche in italiano L2 da parte di apprendenti sinofoni. I suoi interessi di ricerca riguardano la didattica e la promozione della lingua cinese, la didattica plurilingue, l'acquisizione dell'italiano da parte di sinofoni.

EN Andrea Scibetta is a researcher in Chinese language and literature at the Università per Stranieri di Siena, where he got a PhD in 2017 in Linguistics and Italian as a Second Language Teaching with a dissertation about Chinese students' development of pragmatic skills in L2 Italian. His scientific interests concern Chinese language teaching and promotion, multilingual education, and Chinese learners' acquisition of Italian as a Second Language.

ES Andrea Scibetta es investigador de lengua y literatura chinas en la Università per Stranieri di Siena, donde obtuvo un doctorado en 2017 en Lingüística y Didáctica de la Lengua Italiana para Extranjeros con una tesis sobre el desarrollo de competencias pragmáticas en italiano L2 por parte de los estudiantes sinófonos. Sus intereses de investigación son la enseñanza y difusión de la lengua china, la enseñanza plurilingüe y la adquisición del italiano por parte de los sinófonos.

MARÍA PUY OBANOS-GIL
Universidad Pública de Navarra

Book review

Received 15 March 2023; accepted after revisions 3 April 2023

ABSTRACT

Las tareas y los procesos de escritura realizados en segundas lenguas ofrecen a los estudiantes oportunidades no solo para mejorar sus habilidades de escritura y comprender contenidos, sino también posibilidades reales de desarrollo y aprendizaje de la segunda lengua. Partiendo de esta premisa, Lázaro-Ibarrola revisa los fundamentos teóricos que avalan estos beneficios de la escritura y analiza los resultados de los estudios que han investigado las tareas de escritura en segundas lenguas entre participantes de la etapa escolar de primaria. Esta monografía, además, propone nuevas líneas de investigación y ofrece una serie de pautas pedagógicas para implementar las tareas de escritura en las aulas.

Palabras clave: TAREAS DE ESCRITURA, ADQUISICIÓN DE SEGUNDAS LenguAS, ALUMNADO DE PRIMARIA, CONTEXTO DE APRENDIZAJE ESCOLAR

Writing assignments and the process of writing in a second language offer students opportunities to improve their skills in writing and understanding content as well as concrete chances to learn and develop the second language. Starting from this premise, Lázaro-Ibarrola reviews the theoretical foundations underpinning the benefits of writing and analyzes the results of studies investigating writing tasks in second languages for primary school participants. This monograph also proposes new avenues of research and offers a series of pedagogical guidelines to implement writing tasks in the classroom.

Keywords: WRITING TASKS, SECOND LANGUAGE ACQUISITION, PRIMARY STUDENTS, LEARNING IN SCHOOL SETTINGS

I task e i processi di scrittura in una lingua seconda offrono agli studenti l’opportunità di migliorare non solo le abilità di produzione scritta e di comprensione dei contenuti, ma anche possibilità concrete di apprendere e sviluppare la lingua seconda. Con queste premesse, nel suo libro, Lázaro-Ibarrola ripercorre le teorie a difesa dei benefici della scrittura e analizza i risultati di ricerche su task di scrittura in lingua seconda svolti da alunni della scuola primaria. Inoltre, questa monografia propone nuovi percorsi di ricerca e offre una serie di linee guida pedagogiche per mettere in pratica i task di produzione scritta in classe.

Parole chiave: TASK DI SCRITTURA, ACQUISIZIONE DI UNA LINGUA SECONDA, APPRENDENTI DELLA SCUOLA PRIMARIA, CONTESTO DI APPRENDIMENTO SCOLASTICO

✉ María Puy Obanos-Gil, Universidad Pública de Navarra
mpuyog@gmail.com

© Obanos-Gil 2023. This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License.
En los últimos años, la investigación sobre la adquisición de segundas lenguas y, más específicamente, aquella centrada en su instrucción y aprendizaje, ha puesto de manifiesto las oportunidades que ofrecen las actividades de escritura para el aprendizaje y desarrollo de la segunda lengua o lengua extranjera (Manchón, 2011). Las investigaciones han destacado, entre otros beneficios, el desarrollo lingüístico derivado de los procesos mentales involucrados en la escritura y en el feedback correctivo (Leow, 2021). Se ha desarrollado, además, en años recientes, un creciente interés por el alumnado de primaria, considerado el grupo más numeroso que recibe enseñanza reglada de una segunda lengua en muchos países. Sin embargo, los estudios realizados hasta la fecha con participantes menores de 12 años son muy escasos.

Haciéndose eco de estos intereses de investigación, el libro Child L2 writers. A room of their own, escrito por Amparo Lázaro-Ibarrola, es una exhaustiva monografía de los estudios realizados hasta la fecha sobre el proceso de escritura en inglés como segunda lengua y cuyos participantes son estudiantes de primaria con edades comprendidas entre los 9 y los 12 años. El volumen forma parte de la colección Trends in language acquisition research publicada por John Benjamins.

Amparo Lázaro-Ibarrola tiene una dilatada experiencia como docente e investigadora y en los últimos años ha centrado su investigación en el aprendizaje del inglés de los estudiantes más jóvenes, concretamente en el estudio de las tareas de escritura (writing tasks). Como docente, su investigación persigue siempre unos objetivos de mejora pedagógica y manifiesta un claro interés por trasladar los resultados de las investigaciones a la práctica escolar.

Por estas razones, el libro no solo se centra en ofrecer un análisis crítico de la investigación realizada en este campo, sino que además señala las limitaciones de dichas investigaciones y propone una serie de objetivos para estudios futuros, así como una guía pedagógica para trasladar los avances de la investigación al aula. En este sentido, este volumen cubre un importante vacío existente en la literatura del aprendizaje de segundas lenguas, ya que muy pocos estudios se han dedicado a la etapa infantil y menos aún a analizar el proceso de escritura en segundas lenguas entre estudiantes tan jóvenes. De hecho, la mayor parte de los estudios (23 de 29) analizados por Lázaro-Ibarrola se realizaron entre 2018 y 2022, lo que refleja la escasa atención dedicada hasta hace unos años a esta etapa educativa.

El enfoque teórico de esta obra se sustenta en el cambio de paradigma sobre la escritura que ha tenido lugar en la última década. La escritura ha pasado de ser vista como una habilidad comunicativa que debe aprenderse, a valorar precisamente las posibilidades de aprendizaje implícitas en el proceso de escritura en una segunda lengua. Este cambio de paradigma conocido en inglés como writing to learn (Manchón, 2011) resalta los beneficios que la producción escrita conlleva para el aprendizaje de un idioma. Entre ellos, destaca el mayor uso de los recursos cognitivos, que a su vez implica prestar más atención a los aspectos formales del lenguaje y, por tanto, una mayor precisión en su uso (Manchón, 2023; Ortega, 2012; Roca de Larios & Coyle, 2021). Por otro lado, no hay que olvidar que las tareas de escritura a las que se refiere esta monografía se llevan a cabo dentro de un contexto escolar, es decir, por medio de la instrucción de un docente y siguiendo un currículum educativo. En consecuencia, las características de la adquisición de la lengua en este contexto (denominado ISLA, siglas en inglés de Instructed Second Language Acquisition) difieren de los entornos que pueden definirse por oposición como naturales (SLA, Second Language Acquisition). En este contexto de aprendizaje escolar debe priorizarse la investigación de los procesos asociados con el aprendizaje explícito (Leow, 2015, 2018) y, al mismo tiempo, dicha investigación no puede dejar de tener presentes las implicaciones pedagógicas de sus resultados (Leow, 2019).

En este sentido, los objetivos del libro persiguen no solo una aclaración científica de conceptos y resultados investigadores en el ámbito de las tareas de escritura, sino también su trasvase a la docencia. Por ello, este volumen va dirigido tanto a investigadores e investigadoras como a estudiantes del área de la adquisición de segundas lenguas. Además, gracias a su enfoque pedagógico y a la guía ofrecida para la transferencia a las aulas de los avances investigadores, también interesará a docentes y a editores de libros de texto.

El libro, que se divide en una introducción y siete capítulos, se organiza en dos grandes bloques. En la primera parte (capítulos 1 a 5) se desgranan las singularidades de los niños como escritores en la segunda lengua, teniendo en cuenta su desarrollo cognitivo y el particular contexto educativo en el que se desarrolla su aprendizaje. En tal sentido, se detalla la influencia positiva que tiene la escritura en el aprendizaje de una segunda lengua. En esta primera parte se analizan también los distintos estudios seleccionados, 29 en total, con el objetivo de comprender el proceso de escritura en la segunda lengua por parte del alumnado de los últimos cursos de primaria. En concreto, estos estudios se centran en la escritura colaborativa, el feedback correctivo escrito, la repetición de tareas de escritura y el efecto de la motivación sobre dichas tareas. Estos son los
criterios que Lázaro-Ibarrola tuvo en cuenta para la inclusión de las investigaciones en la monografía: (i) la posición epistemológica de los estudios: centrada en la escritura basada en tareas (task based); (ii) el objetivo de los estudios: análisis del proceso de escritura y de las variables que lo afectan y sus consecuencias en la calidad textual; (iii) las tareas de escritura: desarrolladas en distintas etapas, incluyendo como mínimo dos textos; (iv) la edad de los participantes; entre 9 y 12 años.

El segundo bloque de contenido (capítulos 6 y 7) recoge las principales conclusiones de los 29 estudios analizados y detalla las líneas de investigación que quedan abiertas para futuros estudios. Este bloque culmina con una útil guía donde Lázaro-Ibarrola establece las implicaciones pedagógicas derivadas de la investigación y propone de forma concisa, en diez pautas, una serie de recomendaciones para implementar la producción de la escritura en el aula.

El primer capítulo del libro aboga por la necesidad de entender los rasgos específicos de los niños como estudiantes, su desarrollo y sus características cognitivas. Se aborda la relevancia de la escritura en el contexto educativo en general y los beneficios que conlleva para el aprendizaje de una segunda lengua. Describe también la complejidad de la recogida de datos cuando se trabaja precisamente con unos participantes tan jóvenes, y concluye el capítulo con un resumen de las principales teorías sobre la adquisición de segundas lenguas que influyen en los procesos de las tareas de escritura.

El aprendizaje colaborativo y sus beneficios abren el segundo capítulo, que continúa con una definición del término escritura colaborativa y de los principios teóricos que lo sustentan en el campo de la adquisición de lenguas. Seguidamente, se analizan tanto los estudios realizados con personas adultas como los que se centran en estudiantes jóvenes en este campo de la escritura colaborativa. Finaliza el capítulo con un resumen de los aspectos comentados más importantes así como de los resultados más relevantes obtenidos en los estudios.

El tercer capítulo está dedicado al feedback correctivo que habitualmente va unido a las tareas de escritura en el ámbito escolar. Lázaro-Ibarrola justifica la necesidad del feedback como parte esencial del aprendizaje, y trata las diferentes técnicas de feedback correctivo divididas en dos grupos. Por un lado, aquellas que se centran en los aspectos más formales del lenguaje: correcciones directas y "dictogloss", y por otro lado, las técnicas con un enfoque más globalizador como los modelos y las reformulaciones. En el último apartado se ofrece un resumen de los principales resultados, así como las limitaciones de los estudios y futuras líneas de investigación.

La importancia de la repetición en el aprendizaje inicia el capítulo cuarto en el que se discute la relevancia de la repetición en las tareas de escritura. Tras ofrecer un resumen de los principales estudios realizados hasta la fecha en este campo, se resumen las ideas clave y se dan recomendaciones para estudios futuros.

Finaliza esta primera sección con el capítulo quinto centrado en la motivación. Así, se analiza el rol de la motivación en la etapa escolar y en concreto en la educación primaria. El capítulo avanza con un resumen del conocimiento científico obtenido sobre la motivación en el campo de la adquisición de lenguas para concluir con la motivación en las tareas de escritura (task motivation) y un análisis de los estudios realizados hasta la fecha sobre este constructo.

La segunda parte del libro comienza con un pertinente repaso de las principales ideas tratadas hasta este punto en la monografía y continúa con las limitaciones de los estudios realizados. Consecuentemente, se exponen también las principales líneas de investigación que todavía deben abordarse. Es decir, se establece un puente entre el conocimiento adquirido y los vacíos que todavía quedan por explorar.

El último capítulo del libro refleja claramente la inclinación pedagógica del monográfico. Lázaro-Ibarrola realiza una defensa de la necesidad de tener siempre presentes y de incluir exhaustivamente las implicaciones pedagógicas en todos los estudios. Por esta razón, se discuten varios conceptos que son de relevancia para la docencia de segundas lenguas, como la capacidad de los niños para escribir en inglés y responder al feedback correctivo, o la importancia de tener en cuenta su desarrollo cognitivo a la hora de llevar a cabo la producción escrita o de ofrecerles diferentes tipos de feedback. Para culminar esta reflexión pedagógica, se proponen diez pautas para implementar la escritura en el aula.

Se debe resaltar la claridad de la estructura de este volumen, que cuenta con un índice detallado y un glosario de términos. La división en dos grandes bloques, el primero más analítico y el segundo globalizador de las principales ideas y con un enfoque pedagógico, asimismo, resulta muy acertada.

Destaca igualmente el equilibrio que se logra entre aspectos que son muy complejos pero que resultan a su vez complementarios como son la teoría lingüística, el análisis de los estudios realizados y sus resultados y su relevancia pedagógica. En cada capítulo se establece una sección para cada uno de estos aspectos clave y
se progresa de forma lógica de la teoría a la investigación para culminar con los consejos pedagógicos. Esta estructura ayuda a entender cada uno de los temas tratados, a reflexionar sobre las cuestiones de investigación que todavía quedan pendientes, y a trasladar las conclusiones al aula de primaria.

Otro aspecto reseñable es el valor que oportunamente se concede a la comprensión de la etapa de la infancia objeto de estudio, profundizando en los aspectos cognitivos y psicológicos de su desarrollo. Tampoco se descuidan factores afectivos como la motivación, que es un elemento esencial para el aprendizaje de idiomas (Dörnyei, 2001) y que, como sugiere la autora, contendría medir en este tipo de estudios.

El innegable valor pedagógico de este libro se traduce también en una defensa del empoderamiento del profesorado como agente esencial en el proceso investigador. Se recomienda aumentar su participación, por ejemplo, recogiendo los datos de los estudios. Las relaciones entre quienes imparten docencia y quienes se dedican a la investigación han sido objeto de preocupación y análisis ya que, aunque a menudo comparten los mismos objetivos, parece haber una brecha entre ambas comunidades (Sato & Loewen, 2022). Artículos recientes han propuesto también una mayor implicación y participación directa del profesorado en los proyectos de investigación para superar esta fisura y promover actividades con soporte teórico y empírico en el aula (Leow, Thinglum, Havenne, & Tseng, 2022).

En suma, esta monografía sobre la investigación de las tareas de escritura centrada en el alumnado de primaria viene a cubrir un vacío en la teoría y en el análisis científico de la adquisición de segundas lenguas. El equilibrio entre la profundidad teórica, el riguroso análisis de los estudios realizados y su indudable vocación pedagógica convierten a este libro en un referente tanto para investigadores o investigadoras como para estudiantes de lingüística aplicada, docentes de lenguas y editores o editoras de libros de texto.

**Referencias**


**María Puy Obanos-Gil**, Universidad Pública de Navarra
mpuyog@gmail.com

**ES** María Puy Obanos-Gil es investigadora en formación en el Instituto I-Communitas de la Universidad Pública de Navarra donde cursa estudios de doctorado. Su investigación se centra en la retroalimentación correctiva escrita en el aprendizaje de segundas lenguas. Es licenciada en Filología Inglesa por la Universidad del País Vasco, tiene un máster en Lingüística Aplicada por la University of Hull en Inglaterra y un máster en Profesorado de Educación Secundaria por la Universidad Pública de Navarra.

**EN** María Puy Obanos-Gil is a trainee researcher at the I-Communitas Institute of Universidad Pública de Navarra (Spain), where she is a doctoral student. Her research centers on written corrective feedback in second language learning. She holds a Bachelor’s Degree in English philology from the Universidad del País Vasco in Spain, a Master’s degree in applied linguistics from the University of Hull in England, and a Master’s degree in secondary education from the Universidad Pública de Navarra.

**IT** María Puy Obanos-Gil svolge ricerca presso l’Istituto I-Communitas dell’Università Pública de Navarra (Spagna), dove è dottoranda. La sua ricerca riguarda il feedback correttivo relativo alla produzione scritta nell'apprendimento di lingue seconde. È laureata in Filologia Inglese presso l'Università del Pais Vasco in Spagna, ha ottenuto il Master in Linguistica Applicata nell'University of Hull in Inghilterra e uno in Insegnamento nella Scuola Secondaria presso l'Università Pública de Navarra.

EMILIA GRACIA
Arizona State University

Book review
Received 5 June 2023; accepted after revisions 8 June 2023

ABSTRACT

This text is a review of The Anti-Racism Linguist: A Book of Readings, edited by Patricia Friedrich and published in 2023 by Multilingual Matters. The volume features nine distinct chapters written by authors from Brazil, Thailand, Japan, and the United States who, via personal narratives, share their experiences with (anti)racism in teaching, research, and publishing in applied linguistics and other related fields. The authors explain key terminology, concepts, and theories needed to understand and discuss anti-racism in language use. Authors also provide recommendations for change in editorial, research, and pedagogical practices that readers could implement to help counter racism in their contexts.

Key words: ANTI-RACISM, APPLIED LINGUISTICS, PEDAGOGY

Emilia Gracia, Arizona State University
Emilia.Gracia@asu.edu

© Gracia 2023. This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License.
1. Overview of the volume

*The Anti-Racism Linguist: A Book of Readings*, edited by Patricia Friedrich, presents nine chapters of content that discuss issues concerning race and language via personal narratives combined with research studies (e.g., autoethnographies and literature reviews). Authored by scholars in the field of applied linguistics, these chapters articulate authors’ different perspectives and experiences with language and race in academic contexts where English language teaching is central.

The chapters identify common instances in which linguistic discrimination intersects with race and ethnicity within academic contexts, and the authors call for anti-racist practices to be implemented on an institutional level by pedagogues and scholars. Although all chapters advocate for institutional change through anti-racist pedagogy, they differ in contextual perspectives and author positionality: authors are academics from Thailand, Japan, Brazil, and the United States, who are working either in Brazil or the United States. Each chapter offers unique takeaways and action items for practitioners and scholars to implement in their contexts.

2. Individual chapters

Chapter 1, written by the volume editor herself, introduces the book by detailing its purpose and goals, while defining key concepts used throughout the chapters. Friedrich, who also wrote chapters 6 and 9, explains that one purpose of this collection is to bring diverse, personal narratives to the forefront of academic conversations by blending them with more “objective” or “scientific” thought, as Friedrich describes it. Friedrich explains that the authors represented in this volume are individuals who come with a variety of lived professional and personal experiences in the East, West, and Global South. By sharing their experiences in writing, the authors create new knowledge for those interested in anti-racist pedagogical practices. In her introduction, Friedrich gives a brief overview of the book’s chapters, raising two important points for readers to consider: 1) the distinction between institutional racism and individual racist practices, and 2) the primary concern and focus of the chapters on historically minoritized populations. Friedrich refers to *institutional racism* as policies, practices, and beliefs that negatively affect minoritized groups of people in their respective institutions or systems (educational, health, residential, etc.), and *individual racism* as racist actions performed by individuals against minoritized groups of people. Friedrich states that in this volume, some authors give examples of both types of racism without stating which they are referring to specifically, and this is because authors frequently engage with both types and move between them frequently. Friedrich also alerts readers to the authors’ focus in this volume on historically marginalized populations such Black, Indigenous, and People of Color (BIPOC) and other marginalized identities as the primary victims of racism. She notes that some readers may take issue with this if they hold the belief that historically non-marginalized populations (i.e., White, cisgender, heterosexual men) also experience racism and/or discrimination, and she argues that not mentioning this as a possibility is unfair. Other concepts that are defined in this chapter include, but are not limited to: anti-racism, diversity, equity, inclusion, belonging, decoloniality, epistemological racism, intersectionality, and linguistic justice. Given Friedrich’s clear and comprehensive explanations of key terms and concepts in this chapter, readers are inspired to approach the forthcoming chapters with confidence.

In Chapter 2, Aya Matsuda, a scholar of applied linguistics who specializes in World Englishes, presents Teaching English as an International Language (TEIL) as a pedagogical approach that, if implemented, could decolonize traditional English Language Teaching (ELT) practices. Matsuda begins the chapter with a brief explanation of how her perspective on racism and ELT has taken shape over the years, and how her own identity as a Japanese woman in an Anglo-American academic context has led her to advocate for anti-racist practices in TESOL. She states that until recently, she had refrained from participating in discussions around TESOL and race due to the complexity of the topic and the nuanced language, dichotomies, and essentialization that can surface. Drawing on the work of Pennycook (1994) and Motha (2014), Matsuda reiterates the idea that ELT in itself is an act of colonization, and that although TEIL is not free of colonial roots, it can be utilized to minimize the impact of colonization in English Language Teaching (ELT), as educators adapt their teaching to meet the needs of the students in their context. This can be done by viewing English as an international language, eliminating native speaker standards and preference for native speaker teachers, in addition to providing students with the opportunity to discuss their experiences, as learners of English, with racism. Matsuda argues that by adopting a TEIL framework, educators can help fight racism and bring (some) justice to their learners.

In Chapter 3, Gabriel Nascimento analyzes Frantz Fanon’s (2008) view of racism via language as a zone of non-being, and argues that the field of applied linguistics must be committed to anti-racism in order to
eliminate this zone of non-being. Fanon's concept of non-being originates from the idea that modernity and “Western” humanism have positioned the White, Western world as a human zone of being, while racializing and dehumanizing the rest of the world as non-White in a zone of non-being. Nascimento, who identifies as a Black Brazilian scholar of linguistics at a university in Brazil, elaborates on Fanon's work through his own previous research on the positionality of Black English teachers in Brazil and their experiences teaching English as a Foreign Language (EFL). Data show that less than a quarter of EFL teachers in Brazil are Black and that this is due to English language education being accessible to only the wealthiest people in Brazil and the community's negative perceptions of Black EFL teachers' competence. The author discusses the racialization of languages such as Portuguese, French, and English in postcolonial contexts (e.g., Brazil, Martinique, and the United States), reviewing research illustrating how Black individuals must perform White varieties of their national languages in order to progress academically and professionally. Nascimento calls for social justice in ELT in Brazil and beyond, as the findings mentioned above can be compared to the reality of ELT in other postcolonial contexts.

Chapter 4 presents narrative-based research concerning discrimination in language use, teaching, and learning. Chatwara Suwannamai Duran shares her linguistic autoethnography, which touches on several common issues regarding attitudes and perceptions of standard vs. non-standard language use in her native language (Thai) and her second language (English). The author reflects on how her assumptions and attitudes about non-standard varieties of language changed throughout time, from her childhood in Thailand to being an international student in the United States to becoming a researcher and professor of sociolinguistics. Duran acknowledges the negative perceptions of non-standard Thai that she had while growing up and her preference for standard English when she first came to the United States as an international student. She recounts how her exposure to non-standard varieties of English in the United States helped to dissipate her linguistic ignorance, especially after she began to do qualitative research in sociolinguistics and teach courses at a university with a diverse student population. Through her autoethnographic research, Duran found that linguistic ignorance can change with time, as a result of exposure to differences.

In Chapter 5, Clarissa Menezes Jordão, Juliana Zeggio Martínez, and Eduardo Henrique Diniz de Figueiredo, all from the Global South, contribute to an ongoing discussion about racism in the context of Brazilian academia. All three authors are Brazilians who, in a Brazilian context, identify as White, middle-class, cisgender, and educated, and acknowledge their positions of privilege within their societal and professional contexts as applied linguists at a prestigious university. They also acknowledge that their racial identity may be understood differently outside of Brazil, as this social construct varies according to societal context. Each author narrates an anecdote concerning racism in academic contexts. One recounts her experience as an international student where she was one of the few White students in the program. Another tells his story about being a thesis supervisor for a racial studies specialization. Finally, a third discusses her experience of rejection in the realm of publishing in Anglophone academia. All authors concur that they had been nearly oblivious to the role racism and coloniality play in the field until they had their experiences. Zeggio Martínez did not realize what it meant to be White in an unfair world until she studied abroad and was one of the few White students in her cohort. This gave her a perspective on the assumptions she previously held about seeing herself as neutral in an unjust, postcolonial context. Once she realized that she was racially different from her peers, she understood that she had previously always seen herself as part of “the norm” and that this allowed her to be oblivious to the experiences of those who were not White. She listened to stories told by her peers about being Black in a racist world, and how they felt their bodies did not belong in certain places. It was then that she realized that knowledge ought not to be “disembodied,” or separated from the body of the knower. Diniz de Figueiredo had to confront the fact that he had ignored the significance of racism in language when asked to supervise a thesis project on the topic. This was when the author had to confront his ignorance on the topic, and it was then that he realized that previously not needing or wanting to know about this topic was, in itself, a privilege he had. Menezes Jordão realized, through an experience where she was rejected for publication, that her English was not “academic enough” for publication purposes. This led her to realize that she had been positioned as a scholar of the Global South, trying to cross the “abyssal lines,” defined by Friedrich in the first chapter (citing Santos [2007]) as invisible demarcations that divide social realities into different spaces (Black/White, East/West, etc.). In this case, Menezes Jordão was crossing from the Global South to the Global North, and was denied entry in spite of her privileges in Brazil. The authors conclude by presenting a collective interpretation of what can be gleaned from their narratives. One common theme observed in their narratives is that of invisibility; prior to their experiences, the first two authors had not previously been aware of their visibility as White scholars and the invisibility that students and professors of color experience throughout
their lives. They had separated the embodied experience that people of color suffer in a colonized world from language and education, until they were faced with experiences where they became aware of racism in said context. As the authors point out, however, this is not surprising, as Brazil has a long history of making bodies invisible in order to erase Black and indigenous identity for the sake of feigning equality. The other common theme between the three authors was that of an abyssal line and Whiteness. Epistemic racism, a form of systemic racism that exists to discriminate against types of knowledge and knowers themselves, was witnessed by the third author when her submission for publication was discarded because her writing did not fit within abyssal lines of the colonized standards of White, Anglophonic academia. The first two authors identified invisible, abyssal lines in their own contexts, created and perpetuated by academic activity. The authors collectively agree that anti-racist work can be done by making abyssal lines visible through inviting other scholars and students to discuss issues of racism and language inside and outside of academia, promoting an anti-racist stance in their work.

Chapter 6, written by the volume editor, presents a discussion about the challenges of being anti-racist while honoring multiple identities. By means of personal narrative, Friedrich explains how race, ethnicity, language, and national origin intersect and shift according to one’s location. She describes how her own identity has been perceived by others according to her location and language use therein. The author identifies as a multilingual Latinx scholar of Brazilian origin and European ancestry, who works in a US university context as a professor of applied linguistics. She describes how in various occasions over the years that she has lived in the United States, people have made incorrect assumptions about her identity. For example, at times interlocutors have (mis)identified her as an Anglo-American woman by only seeing her name and written works, and in other contexts as a woman of color, and an immigrant from Brazil among others. She reflects on how interlocutors made immediate judgements about her accent or lack thereof. In academic circles, she may be admired by colleagues for her ability to speak four languages, but when speaking Portuguese in a public space among strangers she may face linguistic prejudice as bystanders may assume that she does not speak English. Positionality is a key concept that the author uses to explain her experiences of fluid identity based on the context and interlocutors. The author acknowledges that although her experiences are not as severe as those of others, it is important to discuss these experiences in order to create spaces for anti-racist dialogue to occur, since being an anti-racism linguist includes expressing ideas that are anti-racist. Friedrich then discusses the discrimination she experienced in her own creative work. The author had written a novel that was set in Brazil; however, the publisher rejected her work on the premises that it was not stereotypically Brazilian enough. She then published her work with a mid-sized publisher and received three awards. She reflects on how large publishers are limited in the scope of work they find acceptable and are willing to publish (i.e., conventional “Western” narratives), and that explains the low percentage of authors of color that get published. She encourages readers to buy books from small and mid-sized publishers and to commend the large publishers when they do publish authors of minoritized groups. The author explains that linguistic discrimination also happens in academia when non-native speakers face rejection from reviewers with comments telling them to go learn more English. It appears that academic journal editors identify non-native speaker mistakes, differentiate them from native speaker mistakes, give harsher criticism to non-native speakers, and reject their work more frequently. If anti-racist linguists are in editorial positions, they can advocate for scholars that face linguistic discrimination. Lastly, the author discusses embodiment in scholarship, stating that when an author states their race, ethnic background, languages, etc., readers can understand the lens through which the scholar speaks, thus calling attention to the idea that these bodily descriptions matter.

In Chapter 7, Tracey McHenry addresses a historically contentious teacher-student interaction in US schools—the use of student names in the classroom—by providing commentary on historical facts and reviewing literature on the topic. The author begins the chapter by acknowledging the politics of naming. She gives, as an example, the political controversy witnessed in the US government’s naming of the highest mountain in North America, located in the state of Alaska, the author’s home state. The mountain was originally named “Denali” by the Koyukon Athabascans, but was changed to “Mount McKinley”, and then back to Denali again in 2015. She affirms that names are a highly important part of a person’s identity, as they represent one’s heritage language, ethnic, racial, religious background, and even socioeconomic status. The author reminds readers that over the past century new immigrants often anglicized their names upon arriving to Ellis Island, and teachers were encouraged to assign Anglo names to immigrant students so that they would assimilate more easily into Anglo-American culture. The author reviews research studies concerning the discrimination that African Americans face in the workforce when potential employers disregard resumes with names that index
an African American identity. In addition, she reviews research about teacher expectations of student academic success that concluded that teachers are more likely to have lower expectations for students with non-Anglo names, associating them with low socio-economic status and otherness. At the tertiary level, research shows that professors were more likely to answer emails from Chinese students who used Anglo first names, than those who used their Chinese first names. In reviewing the literature and discussing findings such as these, the author concludes that there is much bias and discrimination in practices that involve names. Hence, the author urges teachers to give importance to student names, to let students know that they are encouraged to use the name they want to use, to try to pronounce students’ names correctly, and to call them by the names they want to be called. The author mentions various resources for teachers to use. For example, she mentions, “My Name, My Identity,” a program in California public schools with a website that includes an online course and resources for teachers to learn about the importance of student names and what they can do in the classroom to promote inclusion and diversity. The author concludes this chapter by stating that anti-racism pedagogues must make students aware of their right to use their names in the classroom, and call them by the names they choose.

Chapter 8 focuses on anti-racist practices in the context of teaching history. Authors Luciana C. de Oliveira (professor of Education in the United States) and Joy Beatty (PhD student of Education in the United States) give examples of what a history curriculum designed from an anti-racist perspective looks like. Before revealing what aspects of a specific history curriculum are considered anti-racist, readers are given short explanations of key concepts that frame an anti-racist perspective of history and the teaching of it. Oliveira and Beatty explain that anti-racist pedagogy is culturally sustaining when educators help students maintain the linguistic and cultural knowledge they inherited (from their communities of origin which have been marginalized) while simultaneously giving students the opportunity to acquire cultural competence in the dominant culture so that they may critique it. The authors refer to the South to mean populations that have been historically oppressed and marginalized due to capitalism and colonization. They emphasize that it is important that the knowledges of these communities be validated, and that marginalized people have the voices and agency to use these knowledges. A prominent concept highlighted in this chapter is the idea that counter-narratives must be used in the history classroom. The goal of using counter-narratives in the history classroom is for students to partake in an interrogative process where commonly taught historical narratives rooted in Eurocentric paradigms are questioned, thus decolonizing the history curriculum. The authors insist that decolonizing the classroom is a daily practice and show sample curriculum materials that can help teachers accomplish this task. One example is an assignment where students are given a calendar showing a holiday with two names (Columbus Day and Indigenous Peoples’ Day) with then a set of critical thinking questions about the narratives and historical figures celebrated on this day, including which narratives are dominant and which are counter. The authors also share the Culturally Responsive Teaching Protocol they developed to help teachers identify and address linguistic racism in various media. The authors conclude the chapter by reminding readers that anti-racist pedagogy involves the consistent use of counter-narrative approaches that validate the experiences of the oppressed and challenge the dominant, colonial narratives, giving students the ability to critically interrogate history.

Chapter 9, the concluding chapter, serves as a final commentary from Friedrich, the volume editor, about the concept of human dignity, a principle which has guided her scholarship in relation to anti-racism in linguistics. The author defines human dignity as the idea that all human beings are intrinsically worthy despite their socioeconomic status, and she argues that it is an improved alternative to human rights because dignity encompasses rights and much more. The author continues to explain what human dignity looks like in language use. Included here is the idea that humans have linguistic rights, or the right to learn and use any language they need or want and receive acknowledgement for their language use. Applying the dignity framework to language use would mean questioning the words we use and how they affect others. Using language that is racist violates human dignity. Human dignity can instead be upheld in the language classroom when teachers implement dignity-enhancing practices like offering them alternative vocabulary to use in sentences or role-playing scenarios of conflict and showing students how to respond without attacking others. Another example of this is helping students understand the difference between criticizing a person’s action versus a person themselves. Lastly, the author states that multilingualism itself can promote anti-racism as it helps us to see alternative perspectives which leads to empathy and greater understanding between different groups of people.

3. Conclusion

Overall, this volume presents a fascinating collection of personal narratives from scholars and practitioners in the humanities (with applied linguists accounting for the majority) who are committed to anti-
racist work where it is needed in language teaching and research. At first glance, one might misjudge this volume as being interesting only to those who care about theoretical knowledge. However, this volume proves itself to be useful to practitioners who actively teach language (or even history) in any context (K-16, domestic and international), due to chapters such as 4, 7, 8 and 9, which give actual samples of curriculum and questions teachers can ask themselves and others. In the back of the book, one may also find a series of commonly asked questions about how to be an anti-racism linguist with answers from several authors in the volume. Practitioners and researchers in many contexts will find these questions and the answers to them to be insightful. Anyone who works or interacts in contexts where language is used and racism is existent is bound to find this volume to be inspiring and enlightening.

References

Emilia Gracia, Arizona State University
Emilia.Gracia@asu.edu

EN Emilia Gracia is a Ph.D. candidate in linguistics and applied linguistics at Arizona State University. She is also an instructional professional at ASU Global Launch, where she teaches English to international students, trains international teachers, and designs online language courses. Her research interests include second language pragmatics, computer-assisted language learning, critical pedagogy, and raciolinguistics.

ES Emilia Gracia es doctoranda en lingüística y lingüística aplicada en la Arizona State University (Estados Unidos) y experta en didáctica en ASU Global Launch, donde enseña inglés a estudiantes internacionales, capacita a profesores internacionales y diseña cursos de lengua en línea. Sus intereses de investigación abarcan la pragmática de segundas lenguas, el aprendizaje de lenguas asistido por computador, la pedagogía crítica y la raciolingüística.

IT Emilia Gracia è iscritta al dottorato in Linguistica e Linguistica Applicata presso l’Arizona State University (Stati Uniti) ed è esperta di didattica presso l’ASU Global Launch dove insegna inglese a studenti internazionali, forma insegnanti internazionali e progetta corsi di lingua online. I suoi interessi di ricerca includono la pragmatica delle lingue seconde, l’apprendimento linguistico attraverso le tecnologie informatiche, la pedagogia critica e la etnolinguistica.